Master conjoint franco-hellénique

**Université Paris 8 : Création Numérique** 

(parcours : Arts et Technologies de l'Image Virtuelle)

Ecole des Beaux-Arts d'Athènes : Arts et Réalité Virtuelle Multi-utilisateurs

Virtualizing the Performance Art: IVAPA Project A case study for a Virtual Archive

Athina Kanellopoulou





Paris, May 2019

Nowadays, human consciousness is the medium

#### ACKNOWLEDGMENTS

Deeply believing that our mind is a complicated machine, which is linking every single data in a quite unique form with other info, there is an enormous list of people who, I believe, were contributing to the way I gaze the world today and helped me to develop this project directly or indirectly. Summarizing a shortlist, I would like to mention a few names.

I will start from the end of master degree's process. Thus, I could not miss out the valuable and multifaceted contribution and guidance of my academic tutor Professor Jean-Francois Jego and Professor Vincent Meyrueis for the creation of this project.

I would like to thank Professor Manthos Santorineos for giving me the opportunity to fulfill this beautiful voyage into digital art, as well as the team of Master of Arts "Art, Virtual Reality and Multi-user systems of artistic expression"; Stavroula Zoi, Nefeli Dimitriadi, Tasos Kannelos, Anna Laskari, Vasilis Vlastaras, Taxiarchis Diamantopoulos and Konstantinos Vasileiou.

I would like to make a mention to Stelarc, Boris Nieslony and Medie Megas for their contribution through conversations that we had about Performance Art and archiving contemporary art.

I would like to thank my art professors and friends Katerina Apostolidou, Elpida Karaba, Christopher Marinos and Yvonni Dimitriadou, who helped me to perceive the world through the art and the art through the world.

Last but not least, I would like to thank my colleague Nikos Belomatis for his contribution in prototyping the idea in the three given weeks of the academic intensive project and my brother Alexandros Kanellopoulos for his continuous support.

Finally, in a pragmatistic and material level, I would like to express my appreciation for the Erasmus+ program; without their Scholarship, this work could not have been finished.

#### **Abstract/ summary**

In contemporary art, research and experiential experimentation often play an important role for the visual artist. Exploring the maximum possible spectrum of the field are elements that are part of the art. Apart from the research carried out at the beginning of a project, there is also the realistic result of the project, which is often difficult to be documented with traditional methods for offering a similar experience to the viewer.

This study will explore the operation and functionality of a prototype of the performance art archive IVAPA (International Virtual Archive of Performance Art) which is developed in Virtual Reality environment, where the audience can navigate themselves through the archive as well as experiencing the performance artwork. Through the topoanalytic method of Bachelard, the planning of a memory palace, the concept of realism and Neufert's architectural principles, the integration of this visual language into the virtual reality and the viewer's experience will be examined. The field of experimentation remains open and the project ongoing, because its purpose is the constant integration of older and new performances so that the whole art scene of this kind of art can be included. The study is divided into three chapters. Firstly, the terms of performance art and archive are analyzed, as well as their relation to digitality. Then the method of studying the problem and the spatiality of such an immaterial object is determined. Finally, a description of the realization of the project, audience's feedback and the possibilities of future extensions are listed. The purpose of IVAPA is to preserve, to showcase and to help the audience to immerse to performance art.

### Resume

Dans l'art contemporain, la recherche et l'expérimentation expérimentale jouent souvent un rôle important pour l'artiste plasticien. L'exploration du spectre maximum possible du champ sont des éléments de l'art. Outre les recherches effectuées au début d'un projet, il existe également un résultat réaliste, qui est souvent difficile à documenter avec les méthodes traditionnelles pour offrir une expérience similaire au spectateur.

Cette étude explorera le fonctionnement et les fonctionnalités d'un prototype d'archive d'art performatif IVAPA (Archive virtuelle internationale d'art performance) qui est développé dans un environnement de réalité virtuelle, dans lequel le public peut naviguer à travers les archives et découvrir l'œuvre d'art performance. À travers la méthode topoanalytique de Bachelard, la planification d'un palais de la mémoire, le concept de réalisme et les principes architecturaux de Neufert, l'intégration de ce langage visuel dans la réalité virtuelle et l'expérience du spectateur seront examinés. Le champ d'expérimentation reste ouvert et le projet en cours, car son objectif est l'intégration constante de performances anciennes et nouvelles, de manière à inclure toute la scène artistique de ce type d'art. L'étude est divisée en trois chapitres. Tout d'abord, les termes de performance et d'archives sont analysés, ainsi que leur relation à la digitalité. Ensuite, la méthode d'étude du problème et de la spatialité d'un tel objet immatériel est déterminée. Enfin, une description de la réalisation du projet et des possibilités d'extensions futures est proposée. Le but d'IVAPA est de préserver, de présenter et d'aider le public à s'immerger dans la performance.

# TABLE OF CONTENTS

Introduction	10
1 Performance Art and Art Archives	13
1.1 Performance Art	13
1.1.1 Term	15
1.1.2 Historical Analysis	16
1.1.3 Fine Arts and Virtual Reality	25
1.1.4 Categorization of Performance Art	29
1.1.5 The riddle of documenting and preserving Performance Art	30
1.2 Archive	32
1.2.1 Term and Analysis	33
1.2.2 Characteristics	35
1.2.3 History of Archiving the Art	36
1.2.4 Categorization of Archives of Art	38
1.2.5 Space and Archive	39
1.2.6 Performance Art Archives	40
2 The advantage of technology in Archiving Art	43
2.1 The need for a new type of archive	44
2.2 Exhibition design and exhibitions' curatorial design	46
2.3 Advantages and Disadvantages	48
2.4 Usages in art and research	49
2.5 Concept and objectives of an International Virtual Archive of Performance art	49
3 The International Virtual Archive of Performance Art	51
3.1 State of Art	51
3.2 States of Work	51
3.2.1 IVAPA Prototyping	51
3.2.2 New Form and Inputs in the IVAPA Project	68
3.2.3 Feedback of users for the development	86
Conclusion	90
Bibliography	92
Webography	95



# Introduction

In the following chapters, the idea of a virtual archive, dedicated to Performance is going to be examined. The urge of documenting, archiving and helping the audience to experiment again a project of performance art that is finished leads to study about the possibilities of this heterotopic structure. Moreover, the documentations of each artwork are in different places, many times difficult to find. Also, the space needed for a propped and expanding archive could be enormous. All these are obstacles in conservation, experience and familiarizing an artwork. A build of a space, which could be expanded at the time needed, it's documents could be approached from the house of visitors, accessible at any time should be the best solution. In the times of the digital era and the mixed realities, it is significant to experiment with the capabilities of new technology. The answer to the questioning above could be virtual reality. The creation of a Virtual Archive including specifically Performance Art documentations, and in parallel VR experiencing a re-enactment of each performance by avatars (humanoids) could be a step closer to eliminating the limitation that the actual reality involves.

The main research questions on the hypothesis are how the performance art could be engaged with the virtual reality in order to form a similar re-enactment of performance art pieces, if the audience is willing to embrace this kind of archive, how audience is perceiving the virtual space for immersing to this archive and what the virtual structure of an archive, space of even performance could be for having the maximum impact in audience.

Using the Method of Topoanalysis of Bachelard as well as architectural disciplines, mainly Neufert's Architect's Data, a virtual space is being built for including structures, such as virtual museums and virtual performances accompanied with their archive of texts and documentations. This is a prototype of an idea which suggests a new way of recording and archiving; the wide field of virtual reality.

For achieving a result, a big spectrum of the digital world is been examined. Firstly, research in depth, focusing on the terms and the functions of Performance Art and Archive and a glance in philosophical streams is necessary. For the practical part, the know-how and the engagement with technology, like MoCap systems, 3D modeling, and VR engines is of great importance.

The methodology, that is used, has both an experimental basis and a philosophical scope to the discipline of Performance Art, trying to attribute the proper aesthetics. Finally, an important point is that the project will be a long-term on-going process because the purpose of it is to include all the performance art scene.



# **1 Performance Art and Art Archives**

Memory is often a fundamental concern for the creation of contemporary artists (Farr 2012. 12). But conservation the realized memory of the artwork is of the same gravity. Archives, like this of Image 0.1, are structures that can convey the basic context of a work of performance art. But before getting deeper in a connection between these two fields, it would be advisable to clarify the terms and characteristics of performance art and archive.

## **1.1 Performance Art**

Performance Art is going to be the future Yoko Ono

In 2016, art theorist Jonah Westerman underlined that "performance is not (and never was) a medium, not something that an artwork can be but rather a set of questions and concerns about how art relates to people and the wider social world" (Balasegaram 2017).

It is necessary to clarify what exactly performance art is, for understanding the cases of this study. Performance art is the area that links Performing arts, such as theater, dance, somatic theater, etc., with Fine Arts, like painting, sculpture, architecture, and new media disciplines.

For Performance Art, the body of artist or participants is being seen as an instrument carrying materiality and meanings and could be a work of art in or/and out of itself.

The differences are subtle between the two categories of art. Even performing artists epitomize developments in performance art, with many delightful examples from art history. Yvonne Rainer's first experiments and thoughts about this bodily deconstruction of dancing movement and usage of the body as an art



*Image 1.1* Yvonne Rainer Hand Movie. 1966

language started in a hospital where she was recovering from surgery (Bukhari 2017, 49). She could dance only with her hands; thus, she created the video Hand Movie (Image 1.1) in 1966,

which was first perceived as a choreography but later art theory classified it in performance art videos. Another choreographer, Trisha Brown, explores the movement of the human body out of the box of the established technics, highlighting the improvisation by evolving the process in performance circles. Both explored in depth the natural body and the urge of tactility in private and public environments. At the field of music compositing, Phillip Glass and John Cage were investigating types of collaboration and merging fine art language in the traditional composition. In this attempt to overcome the formal compositional methods, they exiled the typical narrational methods and adopted sketches and storyboards to base each composition. Moreover, during the teaching period of Cage at the New School, his class, titled "Experimental Composition" considered as Happenings<sup>1</sup> and influenced Fluxus art movement.

Through these examples, it is easy to understand the intention of those artists to add an avantgardeness<sup>2</sup> to their artworks, but as Jeanette Joy Harris supports this attempt of breaking free from traditional norms and disciplines is not enough to considered as performance art and it lays on the golf of performing arts (Harris 2018). Performance artist was into an experimental state of exploration rather than including bodily elements in an artwork. The final piece cannot be replicated or re-enacted with surgical accuracy, it cannot be measured and get on a shape of rehearsals, in contrast to the definability and recreation inherent in the performing arts. For many people, who are engaged in performance art theoretically or practically, "It could not even be accurately documented through photography or video. It was an action that existed in a moment and then evaporated. It was a work of art – strictly in the present tense - that had not really existed before" (Harris 2018). The ephemerality is the big picture of Performance Art. This is the main difference between performance art and performing arts. Works cannot be recreated as in their first form. Of course, there are performance artworks still connected and in relation with other performing arts, such as music, dance, theater, as well as other performances in which performers do not use performing art disciplines.

A performance artist is capable to create collaborative links, to be influenced and influence other art disciplines, and to borrow technics for his/her artwork. This capability is offered for the aim of creating unique and temporal qualities for the artwork. In this way, the audience receives a unique experience and an alternative way to express a problematic. That makes performance art irreconcilable, difficult and breathtaking, absurd and perfectly reasonable. Thus, it is of great importance to consider them art two different disciplines.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>1</sup> included performance artist Allan Kaprow, who invented the art term "Happening"

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>2</sup> See Index of Terms "Avantgardness"

### 1.1.1 Term

After the detailed analysis of the difference between performing arts and the discipline of Performance Art, it is necessary to give a strict definition of the term. There are numerous approaches to describing etymologically Performance Art, as well as its connections with the other art disciplines (Image 1.2 and 1.3).

"Performance art is a term used to describe art in which the body is the medium or where live action is involved or taken place." (The Art Assignment 2016)

For Tate Britain, performance art contains all that projects which can be considered as "Artworks that are created through actions performed by the artist or other participants, which may be live or recorded, spontaneous or scripted." ("Performance Art – Art Term | Tate" 2019)

In the opposite side of Atlantic Ocean, in New York, MoMA puts another explanation for this term. "An event that could include a diverse range of actions, movements, gestures, and choreography. Performance is often preceded by, includes, or is later represented through various forms of video, photography, objects, written documentation, or oral and physical transmission." ("Performance" 2019)





Image 1.2 Dick Higgins, "Intermedia Chart" -Original sketch for the Italian version, Laser printed, 28 x 21 cm, 1995



Image 1.3 "Intermedia Chart" -Variation by P. Corner, Manual intervention on digital printed cardboard, 100 x 70, 2009

### **1.1.2 Historical Analysis**

This kind of art is not a new one; mankind has used the body as a medium to express their feelings to a specific audience by realizing rituals, storytelling, dances, etc (Image 1.4). Soon the world seemed to base its history on objects and be oriented to specific things<sup>3</sup>. Undoubtedly, in the art field something relevant happened, there were specific and well-framed objects, such as paintings, sculptures, drawings,



*Image 1.4.* Ancient Greek vase painting of bacchantes dancing

and architectural structures but never detailed and strictly formed explanation about performing arts. This is because the genre of live action art is not referring to specific objects, it belongs to other disciplines, the performing arts.<sup>4</sup> But from the end of the 19th century, and definitely from the first two decades of the 20<sup>th</sup> century, art began to include elements of live action and experiment with its traditional limits.

In the 1910<sup>th</sup>, for the Italian Futurists, performance art was the monodromic discipline to approach as many people as the medium could. They presented noise concerts and "a kind of disruptive variety theatre" (The Art Assignment 2016) going for decimating, quoted, "the solemn, the sacred, the serious and the sublime in Art" ("Modernism", 37).<sup>5</sup> The futurists saw the artist as an insane dreamer. The first futuristic performance could have been a manifesto and not performative action. In the rush of their own manifesto, propagandistic acts took place. The story starts on 20/2/1909, in Paris, when the first manifesto was published in the popular journal Le Figaro signed by the artist and poet Filippo Tommaso Marinetti. Le Figaro was chosen to be the target of his "incendiary violence" text. This prototype attack against the traditional aesthetics of painting and literature that academies and institutions imposed, was not unknown in Paris, which was a big art center. (Goldberg 2011, 11). As was manifested on the "Technical Manifesto of Futurist Painting - 1910" at the fifth declaration, "the name of a

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>3</sup> objective perceive and perspective, it is oriented to formed things mainly material

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>4</sup> like theatre, ballet, Opera, etc

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>5</sup> They kept the A of art in capitals, as Marinetti proposed. (Carr 2012, 152)

madman with which it is attempted to gag all innovators should be looked upon as a title of honor" (Dancey 2011, 41).

Dada artists were engaged with this medium as well, during and after World War I, based in central Europe. In 1916, Artist Hugo Ball and Emily Hennings established cafe Voltaire in Zurich. They called on poets, writers, sculptors, and painters to express their thoughts through performances, based on music, sound, dance and reading. Due to the improvisational nature of these acts, nobody could predict the final picture of each project; one scenario of this spontaneous art result could be the performance of Image 1.6 (Seegers 2019).

During the Weimar years, the institution of Bauhaus<sup>6</sup> in which students had the opportunity to explore relationships between space, sound, and light (Shelley 2019), has the first institution where an interested person could find a performance class. Thus, performance art became an autonomous medium. On contrary to the provocative and edgy performances of **Futurists** and Dadaists, **Bauhaus** faced performance art is a constructivist approach (Image 1.5). Thus, performance art studies were inserted officially in academic system in 1920 due to Oskar Schlemmer, a professor with a great reputation in painting, sculpture and avant-garde art interested in a transition between visual and performance art language (Kulenović 2017). (Image 1.7)



Image 1.6 Performing act at Cabaret Voltaire



*Image 1.5* Diagram of Oskar Schlemmer. Bauhaus 1-3 1927, 4



*Image 1.7* Bauhaus dancers in Dance of Space, 1926, Oskar Schlemmer

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>6</sup> See Intex of Terms "Bauhaus"

Avant-Garde Theater was prospered across Europe, advancing the "theatre of Cruelty"; a theoretical approach of Antonin Artaud, for which he claimed "We abolish the stage and the auditorium and replace them by a single site, without partition or barrier of any kind, which will become the theatre at the action" (Banes 2007, 115); thus the line between spectator and spectacle was melting with a direct communication based on the action.

After WWII, at the end of the '30s, art scene changed in United States because of the entrance of European migrants in island Eliot and fight after in New York. "By 1945 it had become an activity in its own right, recognized as such by artists and going beyond the provocations of earlier performances." (Ottmann, 2002). Black Mountain College in North Carolina of the United States became a significant point of interest for avant-garde artists who wanted to extend their experimentations. In this



Image 1.8 Erik Satie's Ruse of Medusa (Le piège de Mĕduse) with Buckminster Fuller, William Shrauger, Elaine de Kooning and Merce Cunningham.

interdisciplinary experimental environment, avant-garde composer John Cage was teaching classes on the stage and modes of collaborative production. During 1948, they produced and performed a version Erik Satie's surreal act *The Ruse of Medusa* (Image 1.8), featuring Merce Cunningham in the role of mechanical monkey, Buckminster Fuller played the nonsensical baron and sets by Willem and Elaine de Kooning. Cage related the music with Zen Buddhism, a thought that was shared to his class; "art should not be separate from life, but an action within life, with all of the accidents in chaos and occasional beauty that entails" (Ottmann, 2002). Participants produced music under unpredictable results, this turned the effort for reproduction impossible<sup>7</sup>. Black Mountain introduced revolutionary and avant-garde approaches in dance, as well. Choreographer and dancer Merce Cunningham declared that every movement could be considered as dance, even the ordinary ones.<sup>8</sup>

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>7</sup> Just like many pieces of the contemporary performance art which is the reason that they are not being tested before the performance's art blooming

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>8</sup> He spoke about walking, standing or running

The 1950s was a brilliant period for abstract expressionist painting; in the framework of post-modern art, artists keyed the body's involvement. It is clear and yet underestimated, that each work of art is a report of a progression of actions, involving movement by default. Just after Jackson Pollock's entrance in the art scene (Image 1.9), this became unforgettable and considerable; the art is not just a result but the whole preparing as well. The art critic Harold Rosenberg is depicting this phenomenon, "the canvas began to appear to one American painter after another as an arena in which to act... what was to go on the canvas was not a picture but an event" (Karmel 2000, 123).

The Gutai Group, which formed in 1954 in Japan, made these approaches a stride further. In the  $2^{nd}$  Gutai art Exhibition, Kazuo Shiraga threw himself nude into a pile of wet mud at his performance *Challenging Mod* (1955). Saburo Murakami, in the well-known performance of the Image 1.10 *Passing Through* (1956), ripped a vertical row of paper screens with his body and Tanaka Atsuko wore her *Electric Dress* (1956).

Yves Klein set out artworks concerning and containing the human body. For the realization of these artworks, he employed female models and he covered their bodies in paint; thus, they made imprints using their own bodies on paper. He presented this art practice and results, titled *Anthropometries of the Blue Epoch (Image 1.11)*, on 6/3/1960, in Gallerie Internationale de l'Art Contemporain in Paris.



Image 1.9 Jackson Pollock Martha Holmes. Getty Images



Image 1.10 Murakami Saburo, "Passing Through" (1956). Performance view at the 2nd Gutai Art Exhibition, Ohara Kaikan, Tokyo, 1956.



Image 1.11 Yves Klein, Anthropométries, 1960

The artworks in this period were marking the point of contemporariness in art; Rather than strolling through an exhibition and seeing these things that occurred in the art studio at a past time, it is happening at this moment in front of the audience's eyes.

Allan Kaprow, the inventor of the art term "happening", organized his first performance

in 1959, at Rubin gallery. On the invitation one could read his own statement about the exhibition, "you will become part of the happenings; you will simultaneously experience them" (Townsend, 2014. 104)<sup>9</sup> (Image 1.12). Guests visited the exhibition with no clue of what might occur, both observers and participants in an abstract structure of actions without the pressure to have a full immersion at the project. Kaprow described it as "something spontaneous, something that just happens to happen" ("Performance Art: The Happening – Essay | Tate" 2019).



Image 1.12 Allan Kaprow, 18 Happenings in 6 Parts, 1959

Artists associated with the Fluxus movement believed that art was inhered at conventional events, declaring that anyone and everyone could produce art ("Movement Fluxus"). At the 1962 Fluxus festival, Ben Patterson presented his artwork *Variations for Contrabass* (Image 1.13), in which he disturbed at strings utilizing an assortment of bizarre materials<sup>10</sup>. Nam June Paik dipped his tie and head in a buck full of paint for his performance *Zen for Head* (Image 1.14) and drew a line on a 13-foot roll of paper. Alison Knowles made a big salad in front of the audience while invited them to participate at the process and then she was sharing it to them, for her piece *Make a Salad* (Image 1.15); thus, she changed the art history flow and the foundations for participation just was laid (Wolkoff 2018)

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>9</sup> The artwork now needs its audience for having an existence. This mental experiment is just like the Schroedinger's noesis test -with the cat- of perception, but here there is no cat, just the artwork and its existence through the audience or participation. A common logical test of ontology <sup>10</sup> Such as hammer, roses, ropes, etc.



Image 1.13 Benjamin Patterson, Variations for Double-Bass, 1962



Image 1.14 Nam June Paik, «Zen for Head», 1962



Image 1.15 Alison Knowles, Make a Salad. 1962, Performed at the Institute of Contemporary Arts, London, October 1962.



Image 1.16 Joseph Beuys 7,000 Oaks" (1982). Presented the idea of social sculpture at Documenta 9 (1982)

For many artists the language of performance was -and still is- developing playful actions, but for others, it was/is quite genuine. Joseph Beuys gave lectures and organized dramatic actions, authorizing his ideal for art, the social sculpture (Image 1.16). He was endeavored to change awareness, trusting the art, in a social scope, can and ought to transform the everyday life. He connected performance with a social sense.

In Vienna, an artistic group, named "Wiener Aktionismus",<sup>11</sup> organized in 1961, consisting of Hermann Nitch, Günter Brus, Alfons Schilling, Otto Muel and Adolf Frohner,

("Hermann Nitsch Biography") artists who sought after a social awareness in the framework of art, called actionism; believing on it not only as a disciple of art, yet most importantly, as an existential frame of mind. Hermann Nitsch authorized ancient "aesthetic rituals glorifying existence" ("The Orgies Mysteries Theatre, Nitsch.Org". 2019.) and he organized a series of exhibitions under the umbrella of actionism. Another actionist artist, Valie Export, through her diverting yet arraigning enactment Tap and Touch Cinema (Image 1.17), she was wearing a curtain box completely unclothed at her upper body (core) and inviting people in public space to touch her, scrutinizing the objectification of women's bodies.

At the violent decades of 1960 and 1970, the performance art made its mark. The Civil Rights Movement and second-wave feminism remarked the fact that the body is a political instrument. Artists took advantage of this potentiality. Performers demonstrated their thoughts about sociopolitical situations and inequality through their bodily artworks. In this way, the right on the body was reclaimed and



Image 1.17 Valie Export, Tap and Touch Cinema



Image 1.18 Yoko Ono, Cut Piece. 1964

added in the art practices; an excellent example is Yoko Ono's *Cut Piece* (1964) (Image 1.18). Through the performance of these years, artists discuss the femininity, the gender, political and racial identity as well as bodies that unite different characteristics. Thus, the body could be reclaimed and repositioned through numerous focal points, by the actual people being referred to and not by human models.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>11</sup> which means Art in action

Phenomenology was a discipline ideal for the artists of minimalism, as well as they were keen on investigating consciousness. This point of focus was of great interest for performance artists also. Embedding human body into fine arts was a prompt method way to agitate the delusion that an all-inclusive point of view exists, insisting that everyone is a record of facts, culture, history, and identity and is dependable in flux. These identities could do and involved in the art in different ways. They practice art through numerous different ways, by becoming part of the art or being the art piece, situating themselves or others in specific space,<sup>12</sup> acting by themselves or direct other people to act instead of them. They create clothes and constructions specifically for their performative body or rip theirs. They followed strangers, changed identities, created spaces, tested endurance and limits. They totally merged art and life. They investigated sexuality, exoticism, and the weight of art recorded portrayal historically and practically.

Since 1970, performance art has been a moderately steady structure in the realm of art, utilized globally to enlighten a wide scope of issues. Artworks have been recorded, archived, exhibited, away from the market system. Nowadays, Performance Art is so many different things because the observators have different subjectivities.

The performance is an interdisciplinary form and still flourishes in the spaces that the other spectrum of fine arts cannot cover. A lot of artists have utilized performance as a methodology to purposely affront, overturn tradition, and revamp the art and the art world as insiders. Performance art was conceived of a craving to smooth hierarchies that exist in the framework of art. Thus, artists and audience could develop communication through the artwork. Performance art is referring to these artists who cannot conform to the other art disciplines or those who want to combine more disciplines adding the human action or body.

Likewise, with every art discipline, it is the audience's decision if they are about to engage the artwork or reject it, as well as the rate of immersion into it. One way or another, Performance Art is about clutching and moving the audience, from the first point of view, which is characterized by balance and security that it is not referring to a truth. The new position of the audience is uncomfortable, but this is the role of performance and this supposed to be its function, to alternate the way of thinking and perceiving the world.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>12</sup> Landscapes or urban-scapes



Image 1.19 RAND Technologies, GRaIL. 1968-9

Image 1.20 David Hockney, installation view, Hockney – Van Gogh: The Joy of Nature.



Image 1.21 Anna Zhilvaeva, painting in VR the painting of Eugene Delacroix "Liberty Leading the People". 2018, Louvre Museum



Image 1.22 Kate Cooper, *Infection Drivers*. 2018, Stedelijk Museum. video still

#### 1.1.3 Fine Arts and Virtual Reality

The present and the future of Art is always depending on the engagement of new technologies in its framework. It is already known that digital arts, which examine the term and the boundaries of digitality, in this field have already adopted Virtual and Augmented reality, through gaming, interactive artworks. Moreover, performing arts tempt to adopt technological revolutions easier than fine arts. There are numerous examples from the music and composing scene, theater, and dance of artists who are enriching their artworks with new elements.

Digital art was once the black sheep of traditional arts, or better said the exiled entity. Many artists, theorists, and art critics had disapproved the founding of a bridge between 'traditional' fine arts and digital art. Of course, this is not the first negations in art history. There were the same skepticism and negotiations between old-style artists and new media artists and theoreticians when photography and video used for firsts time under an artistic prism.

But the art was developed in an already known way and the same steps are been followed by digital arts and digital realities. After the invention of the first graphical manipulation program Sketchpad in 1963 from Ivan Sutherland, and its release in Rand Tablet, involving with the GRaIL Project in 1968 (Image 1.19)<sup>13</sup>, and the parallel development of ID and Bit Pad using CAD programs painters find another space to express their creativity. In contemporary art, a big conversation started from how to include digitality in traditional fine arts and how to adopt the technics in the traditional language of arts. Digital painting, nowadays, is a painting medium. As it was obvious in the exhibition "Hockney – Van Gogh: The Joy of Nature"<sup>14</sup> in Van Gogh Museum, David Hockney presented a dialogue of his recent artwork inspired by his idol, Van Gogh. The cutting-edge fact was that 30% of the exhibits are digital painting and illustration<sup>15</sup> of Hockney, including one 2D animation (Image 1.20). Thus, there was not just a depicting of reality from the point of view of two contemporary artists, but also a pictorial construction under the umbrella of digitality.

In the rush of evolution, from the digital painting and 3D sculptures, digital art made a conceptual leap to the action painting. Using Tilt brush of Google, Anna Zhilyaeva made a cut in the use of virtual reality technology; she creates artworks in the technic of action painting, as a contemporary Pollock, but with the spatial elements, using the benefits of technology to

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>13</sup> From the worlds GRAphical Input Language. The Grail Project is an experiment in man-machine communications. (Ellis 1969).

 <sup>&</sup>lt;sup>14</sup> ("Bezoek Het Museum Over Vincent Van Gogh - In Amsterdam - Van Gogh Museum" 2019)
<sup>15</sup> iPad art

enhance her art. In the summer of 2018, she performed an action painting session<sup>16</sup> in VR, by drawing a 3D interpretation of the emblematic painting of Eugene Delacroix "Liberty Leading the People"<sup>17</sup> (Image 1.21) in Museum of Louvre (Craig 2019), attracting the digital art world. Starting experimentally from independent artists, nowadays, digitality gains terrain in the field of fine arts and tempts to be one of the traditional mediums. Many exhibitions host digital artworks, using 3D animation, Virtual, Augmented and Mixed Reality.

Virtual, augmented and mixed reality is another medium. Considering that this kind of truth is not a fake one or an unreal, but it can exist in parallel with the actual reality. In fact, the medium is not the digital realities<sup>18</sup>, but human consciousness. Thus, it is reasonable to see digital exhibits to be presented in the framework of exhibitions or collections of big museums. Digital Body<sup>19</sup> is another existence, with or without artificial intelligence is a new vessel for the creation and representing Body Art<sup>20</sup>. Here, it is useful to mention an example from the contemporary art exhibition Freedom of Movement held in Stedelijk Museum (Amsterdam). In the exhibition, concerning the movement of body or bodies of any entity, there was the *Infection Drivers* (2018) (Image 1.22), a computer-generated video of Kate Cooper, talking about this reality through her by destabilizing the idea that the visible world is a picture of the truth outside of their own framework and "exploring how computer-generated images are complicating the division between subject and object." ("Kate Cooper" 2019) these images occupy a liminal realm between fiction and reality.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>16</sup> Zhilvaeva 2018. Online video

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>17</sup> It is an oil painting (sized 260 cm x 325 cm) of 1830, part of museum's collection, inspired by the French Revolution of 1830 and it is also known as "Les Trois Glorieuses"

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>18</sup> See index of Terms "Digital Reality"

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>19</sup> See Index of Terms "Digital Body"

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>20</sup> See Index of Terms "Body Art"



*Image 1.23 Ed Atkins* Even Pricks *2013* 16:10 HD video with 5.1 surround sound.

Image 1.24 The artist Stelarc reveals the current state of his ongoing "Ear on Arm" project.



Image 1.25 Anish Kapoor, Into Yourself, Fall. 2018.



Image 1.26 Pierre Huyghe, After ALife Ahead. 2017

The extraordinaire subject in this institutional framing of digitality in fine arts is the summer school of Venice Biennale which offers a category for virtual reality cinema (Venezia 2019). In fact, the title of this year's biennale<sup>21</sup> forsigns that what one can feel, that we are living in interesting times. Speaking about Venice Biennale, it is significant to mention some of the digital artists who are shortlisted in this celebration of art. At this biannual Venice Biennale (2019), the audience will observe artworks like Ed Atkins' hyper-realistic



Image 1.27 Jeff Koons, Pryne. 2018. video still, virtual reality

conceptual animations (Image 1.23) and Tarek Atoui's soundscapes.

Thus, from the father of prosthetics, Stelarc (Image 1.24), the video art of Bill Viola and the environments of Pierre Huyghe (Image 1.26) to the virtual reality experience *Into Yourself, Fall* (2018) of Anish Kapoor (Image 1.25), the latest virtual reality ballerina Pryne of Jeff Koons (Image 1.27), and the Rainbow of Olafur Eliasson, Digitality and Virtual Reality consistently gains space in the frame of traditional Fine Art.

All the disciplines of traditional art participate in this brand-new blooming of technological engagement. Performance Art could not be excluded. The first virtual reality performance of the 'grandmother'<sup>22</sup> of performance art Marina Abramovic, Rising (2018) (Image 1.28) developed by Acute Art ("Marina Abramovic - Acute Art" 2018) and presented during the Nobel Week, proves that Virtual Reality is a thing to use for engaging the audience and speak in terms of fine



Image 1.28 Marina Abramovic, Rising. 2018. video still, virtual reality

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>21</sup> The title is "May You Live in Interesting Times" and it is curated by Ralph Rugoff ("Biennale Arte 2019 | Homepage 2019" 2018)

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>22</sup> Marina Abramovic refers to herself with this nickname, based on the lecture that she gave on Benaki Museum in Athens at the exhibition As One and retrieved by the research of Mary Richards (2017).

art. It is a concern about climate change formed as a video game. Felling familiar with this technology and concept, she had another ideal for extending this conversation between Virtual

and Augmented Reality and Performance; but this time to create a pure performance artwork through AR. Her performance *The Life* (2019) (Image 1.29), presented recently<sup>23</sup> in Serpentine Galleries of London, undermarks that the dasein which Abramovic proposed in the past through performances like *The artist is Present* (2010, MoMA), is history after the cataclysmic racing of digitality and without doubt gave a notable amount of ground to digi-sein with this new art-piece, where the artist is not present anymore, but her



Image 1.29 Marina Abramovic, The Life. 2019, VR performance

avatar; thus, the idea/concept of her is still here. A prelude of embodying a digital body for visible but not physical appearances in art is already proposed. Abramovic takes the audience from the virtual museum to augmented reality in the arts.

### 1.1.4 Categorization of Performance Art

From the examples of every traditional fine art, there are plenty of different styles and points of interest. As one can understand the same situation exists in performance art. A multi-leveled system of links between styles, influences, and interests is a difficult thing to determine. The Circle of Performance Art (Dirmoser, Gerhard, Nieslony, Boris. 2014. 109)<sup>24</sup>, a diagram about performance art describes every genre of performance art as well as the relative forms in the same field of art.

For this research, the main concern is to divide performances according to the elements of each one, based on spatial, durational, kinetic and audience engaging characteristics. There are private, public and a combination of these two elements. Moreover, a performance was held in urban or land area. Artwork could be based on the audience's observation, involvement, and

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>23</sup> February 19th, 2019

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>24</sup> For imprinted visible scale use A1 format in full page)

participation or even absence. The performer could perform his/her artwork with the minimum of movements, almost static, or design his/her piece in maximality trying to discover speed's limits and limitations or even variations and combinations like a synthesis of movements.

Finally, a performance could be a momentary action or a long durational performance which could long more than a year. Additionally, a performance project could be held by one or more artists, or the absence of the artist, like the *Body Pressure* (1974) of Bruce Nauman, which was given in notes to the audience.



Image 1.30 The Circle of Performance Art Created by Dirmoser Gerhard and Nieslony Boris

#### 1.1.5 The riddle of documenting and preserving Performance Art

Performance artist was always concerned about the documentation of their artwork. The usual media is photography and video, and more rarely could be audio. Nowadays, there is an effort with technology and data management. Many artists are editing their video documentation of their own performances. Even more, artists have the proper equipment for

capturing an artwork. Almost every artist knows how to save a video and photographs in a digital file and create an archive.

All the previews analysis of the history of Performance Art is based on documentations; texts, audio and visual captures of each art piece or action. So, there are clues for the already known performance art due to new media, which served the aim of conservation. In contrary, there is no evidence of the existence of performance art scene from the ancient world, even if texts and oral traditions are speaking about epitelesis<sup>25</sup> in ancient Greece<sup>26</sup> as well as many rituals around the world.

The paradox of archiving the art is that this urge began to exist after the rise of the most difficult art genre for documentation and archiving, the performance art, basing on the research of Tate Britain and Khan Academy (Webinar, 2019). Of course, at the previous decades and centuries, many artists try to classify their work and create an archive; but the ephemeral nature of performance gave birth to this urgent need. The only evidence of the art piece of the performer is the archive of the work, thus every artist of performance art should have an archive for proving and re-showcasing his/her artwork. In fact, most of the artists keep their personal artwork's archive of records, such as photographs, videos, texts, interviews, critics, notes, sketches, etc.

An interesting approach in archiving the documentation of performance art, even if they are videotaped, photographed or just texts and oral evidence of performance is made by German performance artist, curator, and researcher Boris Nieslony. His research work is named Circle of Performance Art. It is about categorizing and archiving performance art genres, as mentioned above. For the needs of this archive, there is a big space in Germany, dedicated to the purposes of the archive.

From the scope of an international artist, researcher or even audience, it is difficult for the individual to fulfill research in depth for reaping the experience of each artwork, by trying to get a license to visit artists or traveling to London, Berlin or New York and visiting every single archive. But even these visits and travels are not enough for understanding an art piece like performance. Performance, as it was mentioned at the previous sub-chapter, is an

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>25</sup> See Intex of Terms "Epitelesis"

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>26</sup> There is a belief of practicing performance art by cynic philosophers in ancient Athens. Specifically, for Diogenes of Sinope, who said to practice performances in public by giving rhetorical speeches or imitating animals, particularly dog, this action characterized him as cynic (cyn in ancient Greek means dog) (Bosman 2006)

experiential art. Readers and researchers of performance art should have other platforms to approach this experiential situation, mentally and physically.

## **1.2 Archive**

It's a post-, post-, postmodern world, but those who forget the past are still doomed to reboot it.<sup>27</sup> Mark Dery

Mark Dery, paraphrasing George's Santayana (2017) quote "Those who cannot remember the past, are condemned to repeat it", notices the importance of preserving the past. But it was not well perceived that this was and is important for humanity, through the pass of history. People from the ancient years developed ways to share the knowledge to the future generation, through art and practice. After the invention of the written word, the ideograms and evolutionally the text, the need of gathering every text and oral information in written format in big buildings, named libraries.

Myth after myth, people developed the ideas of archiving the cultural heritage of mankind. People used to believe in structures that could carry and contain all the fractal of knowledge. Some of these immaterial structures, which symbolize an infinite library and storage of objects and knowledge are the Tree of Knowledge which is described in Genesis and

Qur'an, the Akashic Records of theosophists or even World of Ideas<sup>28</sup> of Platonic Theory, which is the knowledge of the actual an overall truth. All of the immaterial and imaginary structures had the same aim, to conserve and transmigrate everything that was ever written and done, and at the same time, all the ideas. One of the realized structures of the ancient years, which no longer exists, was the Great Library of Alexandria (Image 1.31),



Image 1.31 Ruins of Library of Alexandria

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>27</sup> "Rhizome" 2019

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>28</sup> Platon's hierarchy of the perceiving and unperceiving world of truth

estimated that was established between 285-246 BC in Alexandria of Egypt. It was a part of a larger institution dedicated to the research named Mouseion.<sup>29</sup>

While people were imagining those structures, Cicero developed mind maps and a structure for enhancing his memory, the Method of Loci. The Method of Loci or Mind Palace or Memory Palace<sup>30</sup> is an ideal and immaterial structure in which people after building it and learning how to use it, could find knowledge which is difficult to get recovered.

Through these ideas, the core of these theories was not just to create a structure of memories. Because as psychologist and psychotherapist Rollo May described, "memory is not just the imprint of the past time upon us; it is the keeper of what is meaningful for our deepest hopes and fears" (Hockney 2013). In contemporary times, it is easy to create a database on a shortlist of information about a concept. In fact, every single institution, country, the business already has at least one archive<sup>31</sup>. In a google search, the word archive is a common term of search. Considering that the three examples above are not the only archivists, one can understand that there are plenty of kinds of archives, depending on their use, design and also their creator.

### 1.2.1 Term and Analysis

After quick research on the web, it is easy for one to find the term of the word archive. "Archive is a collection of historical documents or records providing information about a place, institution, or group of people" ("Archive" 2019); Specifically, it could be "a complete record of the data in part or all of a computer system, stored on an infrequently used medium" or even "the place where historical documents or records are kept" ("Archive | Definition Of Archive In English By Oxford Dictionaries" 2019). For the International Council of Archives, it is something more; "archives are the documentary by-product of human activity retained for their long-term value" ("What Are Archives? | International Council On Archives" 2019). In terminological structure, the verb archive dates from the late 19th century. But the word

archive is older with ancient routes; it is written from the early 17th century (in the sense 'place

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>29</sup> Like the contemporary museums. Mouseion is a Greek word, deriving from the route Mouses (the muses, goddesses who protected the arts and literature).

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>30</sup> See Intex of Terms "Memory Palace"

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>31</sup> It could be about the founders, the important persons, economics, fields of interest, people's involvement, etc.

where records are kept') in the French form of the term *archives* (plural). The routes of this word came from Latin *archive*, *archive*, which were a transformation of Greek *arkheia* (plural), means 'public records', from the basic route *arkhē* equalizing the terms 'government' and 'beginning/start' ("The Definition Of Archive" 2019).



Image 1.32 The analysis of the term Archive

Thus, from the beginning of this analysis, it is obvious that there is a terminological more conceptual approach about the function of this idea and another, linked on spatial elements which characterize the occupied space from the installation of this idea. Moreover, the term (*arkhē*) declares the existence of a basis, a route.

An archive is both  $arkh\bar{e}$  and  $telos^{32}$  of a concept. In contemporary Greek, the term telos means the end or the death of something, especially for a situation. Rarely, it could be found with its former meaning, meaning the aim. So, conceptually when something gets to an end, ideally this means that it reaches the prerequisite purpose of the action. When something reaches the telos, means that it is over. But, objectively, could an archive get to a telos?

Morphologically, archives are contemporary<sup>33</sup> records created by individuals or even organizations, as they continue on ahead their activities, therefore they are able to provide a direct/immediate window on past occasions. They can be created and organized in a wide range of formats; such as textual and scripts, photographic, moving image (real action or animation), audio, etc. All of these forms can be in a digital, analog or a mixed format. Usually, archives are held by public and private institutions and establishments or individuals/individual persons around the world, who are aiming to preserve an important amount of human heritage.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>32</sup> Which means the end. See below at 1.2.2 Characteristics

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>33</sup> and most of the times up to date

### **1.2.2 Characteristics**

For having significant value for the society, the basic demand for an archive is to be composed and built as a trusted resource. To achieve this worthiness, they must have four quality elements, according to the International Council of Archives. Firstly, the archive should be characterized by authenticity; the record is the thing that it professes to be, created at the time reported, and by the individual that the document professes to be created by. The second element is the reliability; they are precisely representing the occasion, despite the fact that it will be through the perspective on the individual or association creating that document. The third principle is integrity; the substance is adequate to give a coherent picture. Lamentably, not all archives are finished, thus they lack consistency and a "telos" as an end and not referring to the aim here. The last standard is usability; the archive must be convenient in an accessible area or space and in a usable condition. In the event that an archive will be authentic and reliable, at that point society has to preserve its context for understanding how it is displayed as an archive and why the creator/creators choose the specific substance and format.

Of course, an archive could not be regarded as the precise 'reality'<sup>34</sup>, but as contemporaneous documentation, based on the perspectives of its creator, under a specific spectrum of interest and involvement. Moreover, reading the info of documentation as the viewer is always filtered by an individual's experiences and cultural frame in which one lives and acts.

At the website of the International Council of Archives ("What Are Archives? | International Council On Archives" 2019), some characteristics about the archives are described and analyzed. Often, the archives are retained and renewed by the same individual or institute or a new admin, only if society percepts that the records have the capability of longterm use and contain significant historical importance. The future value of an archive can be difficult to assess, but what it means is that archive collections do not and cannot hold every document ever created. Most of the times, the archivist<sup>35</sup> does not create them as a historical

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>34</sup> The truth is a chaotic term and principle from the Platonian philosophy until now. Based on Plato's allegory of the Cave, one cannot have the ultimate perspective of the truth, once this truth is above his perspective ability. There is always a lack of data for approaching the precise truth.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>35</sup> The individual or part of an organization, with specific skills of collecting, managing and providing long-term access to archives and records. Their role is to ensure the sustenance of the provenance of the objective of the archive, by preserving information about the maker of the specific archives in order to conserve the framework and ensure the survival of every significant substance for long term, and

record consciously. Their strength is that they are a contemporaneous record and must be viewed in the light of who drew up that document and why. The retrieved documents do not have to be 'old' to be part of an archive, there are contemporary case studies of archives concerning the period of their subject they focused on. Many times, the required use of a document is different from the prime purpose. The nature of inputting documents in an archive is to achieve a bigger picture of the subject.<sup>36</sup> One last characteristic is that they come in a wide scope range of analogic and digital media, and not just in the form of paper documents.<sup>37</sup> Archives incorporate composed reports, electronic assets<sup>38</sup>, still and moving images, and sound recordings.

Under this framework, it is easy to realize that an archive is a specific structure which contains info about a subject. As International Council of Archives claims they are "all around us and perhaps they are so prevalent that we fail to notice them". Even water of the sea, which is coming from Arctic Circle Ices could be a hidden archive, an alternative container of information about the pasting life on the Earth. Thus, archives could come from many sources, such as governments, institutions<sup>39</sup>, courts and judicial bodies, businesses, trades unions and workers bodies, religious organizations, universities and schools, military bodies, cultural structures<sup>40</sup>, charities, campaigning bodies and voluntary organizations, communities, families, individuals, etc. ("What Are Archives? | International Council On Archives" 2019).

#### **1.2.3 History of Archiving the Art**

The utilize of the term denotes the importance of archiving over the decades. The chart of Image 1.33, retrieved from Google, depicts the blooming of thinking of archiving.

secondly, to keep the 'Original Order' of the archive, to preserve documents in creator's arrangement, in order to maintain relationships of documents.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>36</sup> Here is an example, from the performance that is bellow "Imponderabilia"; The document of arresting Abramovic and Ulay, was used for their imprisoning, here the same document, when received, is used for indicating the unexpected end of that performance art-piece.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>37</sup> As it was mentioned above

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>38</sup> counting sites and email

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>39</sup> international, national, regional or local

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>40</sup> Galleries, museums, theaters, film makers, performing groups, etc


Image 1.33 Usage of term "archive" from 1800 until today

In the framework of archiving the art, an urge within the art community was born; to engage this action in art. The invention of photography and video has developed the need for recording and, as a result, storing footage. Artist was immersed in the mediums. The first usages of archived material were for creating paintings, sculptures from the footage. Collage and experimental photography and video heeled, with the multilayered works. Using archiving material has reached first pick with situationists, who were gathering small garbage as urban waste.

The ascent of performance art in the 20th century implied that artists turned out to be intensely dependent on documentation as a record of their work, due to its nature. A comparative issue emerged in connection to the Land artists<sup>41</sup>; the interventions which were realized on the field regularly annihilated by every



Image 1.34 Mark Dion, *Tate Thames Dig.* 1999 Credit: Heathcliff O'Malley

natural phenomenon, like wind or rain. In parallel, Conceptual artists<sup>42</sup> regularly harnessed documentation; In practice, the documentation was quickly adjusted to having the status of work of art. Thus, the structure of archiving was a fertile ground for the work of some artists

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>41</sup> See Intex of terms "Land Art"

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>42</sup> See Intex of Terms "Conceptual Art"

and adopted as a form of art, named Archive Art. Tate Britain marks two examples in this discipline; for his artwork Tate Thames Dig (1999), Mark Dion filtered the residue beds of the Thames and showed the substance in wooden cupboards at Tate Britain, in London. More than six years Jeremy Deller, in collaboration with Alan Kane, ordered his epic Folk Archive, which reports pop culture around the United Kingdom and Ireland ("Archive – Art Term | Tate" 2019).

#### 1.2.4 Categorization of Archives of Art

Archives are separated into two categories; this dividing is based on the mediums used in the archiving process as well as the placement of the archive. The first one is the material archive, placed in a building and the other one is the digital, which could be saved at computer memory and digital media. The first category is the oldest; it is space demanding and the user needs time to reach and searches physically the requested information. These old-fashioned archives are commonly found as libraries, museums or material collections of objects. Occupying a lot of space and urging a considerable time in searching, the urge of digitalization in this field was born. Thus, on the other side, there is tempting of minimizing the space that an object or more needs for being stored and globalizing the information. The space-demanding structures of museums, collections, libraries or just archives could not cover the needs of expanding the archives in inputting new documents and material. More and more artists donate their archive to art archives<sup>43</sup> and space should be expanded in all the ways.

Advancing the archiving from the technology, after the World Wide Web invention, the solution of an intersecting and almost limitless archive is already a fact. Institutions, companies, and governments digitalize their archives from analog documentations (films, photographs, texts, maps, etc.) to scanned documents, digital image, video, and audio, 3D maps, Photogrammetric urbanscapes, 3d scanning, 3d models, etc. In these formats, the damage of the material is no longer a problem. The only concern is the updating of their formats. Moreover, the digital object can be multiplied for being part of different spaces or being linked to being approached from different resources. Thus, people who have the "key" (code) could access to this digital archive from their own place. The necessity of global access to each information is almost solved. This interaction, in terms of Lev Manovich (2002, 2<sup>nd</sup> chapter),

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>43</sup> Based on the information of the webinar "Memory, Archive and Conservation"

caused crucial changes to the flow of archiving history. From the world based on the paper, the humankind passed to a world based on digitality.

There are numerous examples of digital archives, accessed from the internet, around the world. The cases of the *Memory of the World Register* ("Memory Of The World" 2019) of United Nations, held by UNESCO in 1992, the Internet Archive ("Internet Archive: Digital Library Of Free & Borrowable Books, Movies, Music & Wayback Machine" 2019), the Virtual Archive, the DIVA, are some of these. Among them, there are archives which are containing art, such as the significant archive of Tate Britain, Pompidou Museum, Museum of MoMA including a variation of audio documents, the Archive Of Digital Art (ADA), the very innovative Prado (on Google Earth) and the Van Gogh's Letters with numerous translated letters in the collection.

#### 1.2.5 Space and Archive

As it was mentioned above and based on Tate's website description, an archive is "a store, traditionally, of documents or artifacts of a purely documentary nature" ("Archive – Art Term | Tate" 2019). So, it has spatial elements as well.

Also, by considering the new types of archiving, there is a visible turning back in a spatial perceiving of the action of archiving<sup>44</sup>. The new archiving types have the opportunity to use the digital element of occupying space and be perceived as libraries, museums or similar spaces. It is more than a simple digital space. It is a kind of a memory palace, in which the information textual, sounded or visual can be inputted, without the difficulty of creating a

memory palace and revisiting the information again.

This is the thought that Google adopted in 2011 and created the *Google Art Project*, an immersive online museum. The visitor can have virtual tours in more than 385 rooms



Image 1.35 Sigmund Freud's House

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>44</sup> Even in digital ones, for a good UX (Users Experience)

of 17 museums, including the Tate, the New York Met, and the Ufizzi in Florence (Waters 2011).

There is another kind of archive, designed as a virtual museum. This case can be found in *Sigmund Freud's House*<sup>45</sup> (Image 1.35), which offers a 360 photogrammetric virtual exploration in spaces of the museum, like walking in the same museum.

#### **1.2.6 Performance of Art Archives**

Museums and collections play a very important/significant role in preserving art files. There are also numerous archives of art and artists that work under the same ideal, preserving and re-showcasing art. There is the example that was given above, the Circle of Performance Art, a dedicated archive to the performance art, but still a problem with documentation as well as understanding the feeling/ sensation of the artwork. But no one offers an immersive experience. The experience of performance is sensory, and thus, it makes sense to be represented in an archive to create the same feeling as the original piece. Even in specific books dedicated to archive science<sup>46</sup>, words like "virtual" "immersive" could not be found. The way we preserve the world has changed from the exponential growth of digital technology; thus, it "reflects to ourselves, interacts with the world and creates" (Broadhurst, S., Price, S, 2017. 2). As Heidegger and Merleau-Ponty observed that by building tools/ instruments we project around ourselves a mediated world; thus our "somatic limits" spread to include this new reality. This happened in the past as well, when oral stories become text, lived knowledge turns form to an encyclopedia and the creativity of a person becomes an exhibition, concert, etc. In this sequence, it is reasonable to engage the new media in each practice that could be benefited by it. Thus, the most effortless way to approach and engage an archive until now is through a multi-sensation experience, just like the knowledge that a child takes from a museum.

The preservation of the documents and documentation is beneficial for the public, "for the purposes of the management and justification of the rights, [...] as well as for the historical documentation of research" (Coeure, S., Duclert, V, 2011. 4-5). So, is it possible to use this immersive medium for our advance and as a message to the global audience and researchers of performance art? Until now, we have archives (like ubu.web, electronic art intermix, lada.org,

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>45</sup> The museum can be navigated at the following link ("Explore Sigmund Freud's House, London In 3D" 2019)

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>46</sup> Such as *Dictionnaire des archives* (Afnor, 1991)

**IVAPA** Project

etc) from a third person view as a viewer of a screen or printed media. We hadn't the opportunity to live the immersive experience of each artwork. Through virtual reality, the audience can attend the performance.

So far, performance art lays in the ephemeral zone of practicing, and by the term, it is impossible to be repeated. Even if it is reenacted in purpose to be the same, it is not, because the rhythm differs and the "nowness" and hereness have changed. But still, some of the researchers use to re-enact or trying as an re-experience audience to the performance artworks that the need to explore physically. Of course, it can be documented but until now for experiencing it, somebody has to engage with it by performing as a beginning



Image 1.36 Interactive Art and connections

point, in the same way, that the researchers and simultaneously performers of "Live Art Salon"<sup>47</sup>. Documentation methods should be mutable for suiting in each performance. For researchers of "Live Art Salon" there is no repeatability but the experience of performers and audience was similar between the first and the second reenactment keeping that there is a big gap that past performance is left here and this experiment it was easy for the audience to experience the performers in one or two similar repeats. Although the first base is not the recreation of the second one audience still have the living perform at hard work in front of their eyes that an important element of understanding performance art is to experience it.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>47</sup> A performance experiment, aimed in documenting the artwork, organized for the purposes of the unit "How do we document and archive performance?", part of webinar "Memory, Archive and Conservation" (Tate 2019)



# 2 The advantage of technology in Archiving Art

Real but not actual, ideal but not abstract Marcel Proust<sup>48</sup>

From the phrase of Marshall McLuhan, "the medium is the message" (McLuhan 1967) as well as from the first chapter of this paper was clear that the contemporary medium is human consciousness. The consciousness is a meta-factor of cognition and intelligence, which indicate the reality in which one exists.

But, getting things from a start; is reality real? And which reality is real? These are two questions of considerable importance. As William Gibson noted "Was it Laurie Anderson who said that VR would never look real until they learned how to put some dirt in it?" for speaking about realities (Gibson 2013). Thinking of Schroeder's fundamental experiment about reality and perception, nothing can be real and at the same time, everything can be.

Crossing philosophical approaches about reality and perception, from the ancient Greek philosophers to the recent philosophical theories, there is a big talk about reality and perception. Deleuze conceptualized virtuality, by placing it as a result of a surface effect caused by real and material interactions; the time that a user utilizes a computer, the screen shows an image, which relies upon physical interactions occurring at the level of hardware. The window of the screen is in no specific place in actual space, but it is undoubtedly real and capable of interaction. It is about cognition. The described virtuality is a sort of potential results that realized in the actual. Summing up, "it is still not material, but it is real" (Deleuze).

All these happen because of the existence of some approaches of Representational Theory of Mind by creating logical links between objects and stimuli of actuality and virtuality. Visitors of digital realities are like the observer of the experiment of Schroeder, they have no clue of the inner reality, they can just perceive the reality that is given to their senses and is familiar with their cognitive level. This happens when somebody is out of the representational scene.

On the other hand, there is the internal perception. Now, they are not there but still, are somehow. Spatially (in-situ), it is a kind of heterotopy in the terms of Michel Foucault's theoretical approach. Replacing the concept of the mirror with Virtual Reality, the following

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>48</sup> A phrase describing the approach of Marcel Proust about Virtuality

sentence which describing this utopian object is still correct; "[...] a utopia, since it is a placeless place. In the mirror, I see myself there where I am not, in an unreal, virtual space that opens up behind the surface; I am over there, there where I am not, a sort of shadow that gives my own visibility to myself, that enables me to see myself there where I am absent" (1967). But at the same time as Foucault suggested for the concept of the mirror, "it is also a heterotopia in so far as the mirror does exist in reality, where it exerts a sort of counteraction on the position that I occupy. From the standpoint of the mirror, I discover my absence from the place where I am since I see myself over there" (1967).

The Dasein<sup>49</sup> of Heidegger becomes Digi-sein. A new kind of ontology, a conceptual representation of one's existence in the digital space. This virtualization of the body creates a double of visitor's self, and the id and spatial existence changing places during the hole visit. This double is a Lacanian mirroring as Foucault analyzed poetically above. This double realizes movements visitor's and it is another body, a virtual one; not a stranger's but not the physical one of the users. It belongs to a virtual world. There where the physical body of the user is not belonging and not existing. With this realized virtual body visitor can navigate himself in the VR environment. This space has virtual elements and objects. An archive in such a space is composed of virtual documents, photographs, videos, etc. and still keeps some realistic elements for targeting to users' cognition through the principle of space imitating of the Representational Theory of Mind. The user can understand the environment and act virtually with his new body at the same time that all the orders come from his mind. Thus, he preserves the virtual world as real, because he can claim Descartes phrase "I think therefore I am". So, at

# 2.1 The need for a new type of archive

The creation of the concept of a new type of archive demands some conceptual work in the steps of Representational Mind Theory. Results of a quick mind map (Image 2.1) indicate that the concept of archive is inextricably linked to the preservation of memory. As it was written in the previews chapter, the idea of creating archive structures and preserve the culture led the ancient brain athletes to create mind palaces.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>49</sup> An existential theory of Heidegger, about the human sense of existing and being.

According to Gaston Bachelard, topoanalysis is a method to approach the mind reading special factors. Many artists use topoanalysis for developing projects and digging out resources of inspiration from their own memories, as an alternate of brainstorming method. Psychologists, influenced by Carl G. Jung methods<sup>50</sup>, study human psychology as navigating in a structured building or an existing place.

As each concept has different parameters, memory can be viewed multilevel. Locally, memory





is called the space in which they are stored and from which information is consciously retrieved. As a function, memory refers to the ability to store, retrieve and link information that is vital both for survival and for personality development and acquisition of knowledge. While existential, it is "What gives us the meaning of ourselves and the temporal continuity of our very existence. It is our ability to recall who we are, what we have done in the past and what we are planning in the future. If we could not remember information about ourselves and our actions, then we would lose an important part of our personality. "Finally, neurologically, memory is part of the superior functions of the human central nervous system. It is directly related to perception, consciousness, thought, learning and language.

Memory is a field dealt with by the science of Psychoanalysis, which develops a complete theory of understanding the functioning of the human psyche. While pursuing the deepening of the "systematic psychological analysis of the landscapes of our inner life", he suggests Bachelard's local analytical method in his book "Poetics of Space" (Bachelard 1982). The memory could keep the keys of the past if it was objective. But according to Lefevre, memory works as a poet, not as a historian; there is always the filter of subjectivity over the objective image. That is the strongest reason for creating an archive. Paradoxically, the archive begins to exist if somebody uses his memory to create it.

In the past research, titled "The Poetics of Memory" (Kanellopoulou 2016)<sup>51</sup>, there is an analysis from case studies on how artists use the element of memory through the existing space for art production. In this analysis, topoanalysis played a significant role in navigating the reader. But in a reversed function, to create a conceptual plan for designing space suitable for presenting

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>50</sup> Referring books such as Four Archetypes of Jung

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>51</sup> "The Poetics of Memory" is a theoretical research accompanied the thesis " $\delta\iota\epsilon\pi\alpha\phi\eta$ : the on-touch project"

already existing performance artworks in virtual. As the memory could be analyzed in loci<sup>52</sup> as an actual space, thus virtual archives can be analyzed, especially since it is already built as, including all the elements that make it readable as a real and existing space. Through the method of topoanalysis<sup>53</sup>, and by using the architectural principles of Neufert (Neufert 1970) and Bauhaus, one can re-design the ideal space, gathering all the documents and re-enacting simultaneously the performance; it looks like a mind palace but remoted from the narrowness and mortality of a human brain.

In a similar mnemonic structure, the situationists were turning to explore the urbanscape by perceiving it as a series of feelings and experiences. Thus, experience and feelings became a place for those artists and gained spatial characteristics. And the artwork should be existing in the same place, in-situ. As they developed a spatial memory and in-situ practices.

# 2.2 Exhibition design and exhibitions' curatorial design

The audience can navigate themselves freely in space, but the main study is realized before installing the exhibits. For this exhibition's design, there are three narrational navigation methods that are proper.

The performance in the first view; this category keeps the artwork in the first foreground and gives the opportunity to experience the artwork before exploring the archive. This approach could be suitable for the majority of the audience. But there are some drawbacks. Some performances have a difficult concept and they are designed in the way that people could read something before experiencing the artwork.

For covering this parameter, the second narrational method puts the performance in parallel or in the same space with the archive. People could experience performance and have a meticulous study on the exhibited documents and the additional material. Often, this method is distractive and misleading from the aims of the artwork, thus the separation of performance space and exhibition space for the archive is preferred by curators. In this case, the audience can choose to experience the artwork first or to access the archive.

At the third narrational navigation method, the audience can access artwork after passing and exploring the archive. In this case, people can have every information for the artwork, but sometimes they choose not to experience it, because of the over-information. For

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>52</sup> Loci (plural of Locus) is the place, the exact geographical point. (see Intex of Terms)

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>53</sup> Topoanalysis is a term analyzed in Gaston Bachelard's book The Poetics of Space (1958. 8)

avoiding this phenomenon of a disinterested audience, sophisticated curatorial design of the exhibits is a necessity.

For the interior space, the most common narrational methods of presenting an artwork simultaneously with the archive are the given above. But for the public space thinks are not exactly the same. The indicators for making it clear that there is an exhibition of the archive differ. Recommended tactics suggest big labels and bright lightings on the outside and after the entrance of the exhibition space; the location and the clarity of the entrance are of the utmost importance for inviting and orienting the audience.

 $topo^{54}$ Analyzing in a level (topoanalysis), this place, the door is one of the most significant points of the building. Traditionally<sup>55</sup>, the main entrance creates a dialogue between the exhibition and the citizen. This point is addressed to the visitor of the exhibition as well as the passing one. For the artist Do Ho Suh "it's really about crossing boundaries, not only physical but also cultural boundaries"56 and passages (Image 2.2) have that function, they offer the transition in the way that marks the



Image 2.2 Do Ho Suh, Home Within Home. 2014. installation view

beginning of a different situation. It symbolizes the way out of the pedestrian everyday world and the initiation into the art world. It is the intersection between the controlled and the uncontrolled space.

The first room in the interior should be lightened and spacious. Topoanalytically, it symbolizes the welcoming and corridors conceptualize the links between two different situations/states.

In a total, a virtual exhibition space for not distracting its aim should be made by common materials, like the original structure. Otherwise, a kind of uncanny feeling is taking over and corrupt the experience.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>54</sup> Topos in Greek is the place

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>55</sup> In the existed and material architectural structures

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>56</sup> https://www.ft.com/content/a187c15e-e287-11e6-9645-c9357a75844a

## 2.3 Advantages and Disadvantages

The main advantage of this concept is the purpose (telos) of the project. The preserving and conserving the information in cultural, aesthetic, experiencing and spatial level. The very recent unpleasant and breathtaking example is here to remind the necessity of preserving cultural heritage. The destruction of the Notre Dame of Paris which was held on the evening of Monday 15 April 2019, due to an accidental fire at the rooftop, suggests the importance of digital three-dimensional information. Every picture, video or even sketch of something that is belonging to the framework of Art, every single information is a cultural memory, a memory of human heritage. In a three-dimensional capture and model, the scale of the actual building is the only differentiating factor. Based on the archive of a 3d model of Andrew Tallon (Image 2.3), the French government could proceed to a precise recreation of the magnificent gothic

design of Notre Dame's roof and spire.<sup>57</sup> This genre of archiving data seems to be a convenience for the accuracy of recreating or reproaching a work of art. Furthermore, combining the three-dimensional capture with a virtual reality representation in the actual scale (1:1) the



Image 2.3 3D Model of Notre Dame

audience could have a common visual experience.

Of course, there are disadvantages in using a virtual reality representation of an existed artwork. The Dasein cannot be applied here, it is replaced by the digi-sein of the visitor. This kind of sensation is the one that indicates to the visitor that it is not the actual reality. It is the one that connects every realistic element designed in the virtual space with the uncanny.

But furthermore, there are more difficulties using the virtual space both virtually and physically. The subjects that should be noticed for been studied on each occasion is the body of the visitor and the body of the performer. Embodiment, realistic/non-realistic avatar. Also, dizziness and disorientation are two familiar disorders of navigating in virtual reality.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>57</sup> "Unique 3D Model Of Notre Dame Cathedral Could Help Reconstruction Efforts" 2019

# 2.4 Usages in art and research

A three-dimensional archive is not just about restorations and 3d design or maps; it is about spatial memory. "One cannot relive the memories"<sup>58</sup> but he/she can experience the same subject again. Without experiencing a situation, this situation could never be memory and body experience, the first and most important thing for experiencing, understanding and observing in first person view.

The navigation experience puts the visitor in the place of a figure exploring the space by himself physically (walking) and by teleporting. Ideally, the audience is the protagonist of Vertov's experimental movie *The Man With The Movie Camera* (Vertov 1929), moving in a first-person view, without a visual body in the purpose of not distracting the experience due to the differences with the body of the user.

# 2.5 Concept and objectives of an International Virtual Archive of Performance art

On December 2016, when I was in Venice, during International Performance Art Week, presenting a performance artwork of mine, I met Stelarc. We had some conversations during those days. The last day before living, he offered me unwittingly a precious present through a conversation between me, Boris Nieslony and him. Boris Nieslony already developed complete research about performance art and he created a diagram which includes every single kind of performance art. Thus, Stelarc just teased us asking if it is possible to gather every single documentation, especially videos, in the biggest archive of Performance Art.

That idea seems huge but worthy. Even if I didn't have the technical tools, thus the mentality, to approach a way of realizing that idea back to those times, many times I was thinking about archiving every material that I could find. Sometimes, there is no documentation of past performances. "Mirror Check" is an excellent example of performance with no video documentation. There are some explanations, the re-enactments under the orders and teaching

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>58</sup> As Nobelist in literature and songwriter Bod Dylan quoted.

of Joan Jonas to young participating artists, but not the exact video- documentation of 1977 or more than two photographs for this piece of art.

After presenting some more performance artworks of mine, I was really anxious on how I could document them for my audience; in which way I should realize documentation for help every viewer to understand, to feel or to be engaged by every art piece, no matter where he/she is. I was worried that there is a significant gap between watching documentation from a specific point of view and be a part of it with his/her presence.

Moreover, the procedure of archiving could become really complicated because of the branches that every single art piece has. For example, a performance could be about an activist point of view, a limitation breaker, designed for a specific space and using the actions of the audience to complete the concept. Just like Imponderabilia (1977) of Marina Abramovic and Ulay, presented at the International Performance Art Week in the Galleria Comunale d'Arte Moderna in Bologna (now MAMBo Museum).

Summarizing, the creation of an archive suitable for the medium of performance, which is based on experience and many times the participation of the audience is an urge of significant importance. The IVAPA Project could cover this gap. The objectives of the project are the eutopia for performance art; preserving and conserving as well as approaching a bigger audience from all over the world, through utopia and pantopia that a virtual environment is related.

# **3 The International Virtual Archive of Performance Art**

Whatever you can with your body, you as an avatar can do endlessly. Marina Abramovic<sup>59</sup>

# 3.1 State of Art

The International Virtual Archive of Performance Art is an archive developed in Virtual Reality environment. The purpose of this archive is to preserve, to showcase and to help the audience to immerse to each performance of it.

# 3.2 States of Work

# 3.2.1 IVAPA Prototyping

For realizing the International Virtual Archive of Performance Art, it is highly demanding to the research for specific Performance Art pieces.

# 3.2.1.1. First Performances Choice

Beginning with sensation as though of realization in this project, the main thought was to reproduce the performance in its environment. The first performance which was considered to be realized in the virtual reality environment was Imponderabilia, it was the same example of performance art which was the first slide of Peggy Phelan's lecture in the Symposium Live Culture (2003); an art piece created by Marina Abramovic and Ulay and realized at the Galleria

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>59</sup> ("Marina Abramovic - Acute Art" 2018)

Comunale d'Arte Moderna at Bologna in the framework of International Performance Art Week festival in 1977. In this performance, the two performers stood naked face-to-face in the entrance of the gallery; "the idea was the artist as a door of the museum. [...] So, the public entering the Museum has to pass sideways through the small space between us. Each person passing



Image 3.1 Marina Abramovic and Ulay, Imponderabilia

has to choose which one of us to face because the entrance is so narrow, they could not go frontally" (*Marina Abramović And ULAY. Imponderabilia. 1977/2010* 2019). I will follow the same though with Abramovic, as she adds for the re-performance of this art piece at another exhibition by two couples "what kind of reaction and response the public will have" (*Marina Abramović And ULAY. Imponderabilia. 1977/2010* 2019).

In this project, the need for this immersive experience of reviving and reviewing

performances makes this specific performance the priority of the project. It is important to mention that this performance was reenacted virtually by Eva and Franco Mattes in Second Life ("Eva And Franco Mattes > 0100101110101101.ORG" 2019). There, in contrary to the present project, the viewer can approach and watch the performance through the screen of the computer; here, the proposition is to have an immersive experience of each performance by getting to space and move physically between performers as being there. One step farther than an exploration of "a potential and even virtual new sense of embodied self"



Image 3.2 Eva et Franco Mattes, Marina Abramovic's imponderabilia, (2007)

(Broadhurst 2017, 1), by taking the environment as a new factor.

By embracing the virtual body as the performer's body in the project, many times there are some props or site-specific elements or movements. As it is notable at the rest two performances of the prototype. In the Mirror Check (1970) of Joan Jonas, the artist stood in front of a wall nude and was checking her body through a small round mirror, "seeing 'a succession of places unfolding in time', while the audience watched from a distance of thirty

feet" (VernissageTV 2014). "It's the shamanistic idea – the performer goes through the actions so that the audience can experience them also. It takes you into a space that you wouldn't otherwise be in" ("Mirror Check @ Joan Jonas. 1970." 2019).

For including the first man of this archive, Bruce Nauman's Wall-Floor Positions (1968) was chosen, but because of the fragility of the MoCap suit and the length of performance (1h 05m), it was



Image 3.3 Dance or Exercise on the perimeter of a Square, Bruce Nauman. 1968 ©

replaced with the performance Dance or Exercise on the perimeter of a Square of the same artist, created in the same year. In a square made by paper tape Nauman exercises by stepping under the sound of a metronome, tapping every corner and every middle of each edge of this square. He considers every movement as an alphabet of a conceptual and temporal dictionary.

#### 3.2.1.2. Organizing and Realizing the project

Designing of a pipeline of steps that should be taken as a fundamental action. After choosing the first three performances that would be the first inputs in this virtual archive in parallel with a research about each performance in order to understand in deep the specific art piece for re-enact it and re-design it in virtual space, it was crucial to re-enact the performance, debug the movement captured, design the 3D avatar of the performer.

For re-enacting every performance, it is necessary to learn morphologically the

performance by studying the existing footage and relevant artists' or visitors' texts. All the re-enactments were realized with the MoCap suit (Perception Neuron Motion Capture Suit) (Image 3.4). Moreover, there was a test with motion tracking system (OptiTrack) for Nauman's performance without the willing results.

In the first days, there were problems with the MoCap suit (Perception Neuron Motion Capture Suit). The first experiments were made with a suit which had a broken pin in a connection of neuron. This leads to a lot of bugs in output data during the move of the hands; the problematic connection was at the right shoulder at the second series of experimentations were bugs as well due to the lack of the right calf (leg); there were two pairs of the left calf (leg). After finding and replacing the



Image 3.4 Hand sensors of Perception Neuron

misleading part, there was the last problem to solve; many of the neurons were uncalibrated. Thus, the next day was for recalibration of all the sensors. Finally, after finishing the

calibration, by rotating the sensors in XYZ axons, the experimentations were restarted with accuracy. Firstly, some simple body movements were completed for being sure that everything is going to work. There was a notice of dysfunctions on capturing motion, while wearing the suit, in a distance of 1 meter or less from the laptop. Moreover, 3 neurons were damaged from past usage.

Thus, the re-enactments of the performances have been done, wearing Perception Neuron Motion Capture Suit (Image 3.5). There was a different re-enactment for each performer because the movement differs. Thus, each part was studied for having the most accurate reenactment, conserving the same rhythm, tempo and time.



Image 3.5 Wearing the MoCap Suit

Thus, the duration of each animation is the actual size of the performance from the beginning till the end, before getting in a loop, except the two animations of Imponderabilia, in which Abramovic and Ulay were standing and breathing, which loop correspondingly from the 1'.37" and the 2'.11". This non-synchronicity in the loop was kept for blending the two loops visually.

For Imponderabilia, the difficulty is located in the long duration bodily stability and simultaneously trying to move the exact thoracic muscles for having the illusion of breathing in animation. In fact, it is a minimal constant rhythmic movement which should be real at the same time. The rhythm that Marina Abramovic breaths are different from Ulay as one can understand by watching video documentations in close up, the same goes for the small movements that were made. The motion capture was following. After finishing each performance, there was a time demanded to study the next one. The performances should have a similar breathing and movement tempo for carrying the same qualities. The first experiments were very still, the solution was the realization of very small movements with hands and to breath deeply for achieving a natural shoulder and thorax movement.

For Mirror Check, the virtual re-enactment is based on the documentation of reenactments at the exhibition "Rooms 14" (Fondation Beyeler, Switzerland, 2014) and the documented instructions of Joan Jonas; as it is mentioned above, there is no video documentation (##) for the original performance artwork of 1970, only two photographs from different spaces<sup>60</sup>. The instructions to each re-enactor are to take his/her time to study his/her body through the small round mirror. Here, it was preferable to keep the time limits of the original performance. Thus, the motion capture lasted 10'.24".

For the performance Dance or Exercise on the perimeter of a Square (Image 3.6), it was a necessity for re-enactment to learn choreographically the movement and how to reproduce it (rhythm, rotations, repetitions). This was the most difficult movement until now, because of the differences between female and male physiology, and thus movement. The big side step of Nauman is difficult for a short performer. But thinking the attachment of the movement in the 3d body of Nauman, the decision was to keep it as accurate as it could be. Theoretically, if another approach was chosen, it would be acting and not re-enactment/re-performance.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>60</sup> The photographs are on the exhibition in CheckMirror.exe



Image 3.6 Reenacting Bruce Nauman's Performance

# Design Space Design, Lights and Props

The first thought was where and how the archive is going to import in the space. Thus, the solution of a virtual exhibition in parallel; this could have an educational role, to explain and describe the performance through the given and presented materials of each archive. The plan that was described in the previous chapter, of creating three different narration lines using the space as the main storyteller is the first target.

The most difficult part of the process was the research, especially the one connected with the spaces (galleries, museums, studio's, public places) where performances took place for the first time.

CAD is a basis in contemporary design. Due to the first bachelor and master studies as a civil engineer, it is already known that 2D AutoCAD is quite effective for creating architectural structures during my studies and my stage. So, it would be reasonable for one used in a CAD environment to use 3DsMax for creating space. For modeling the space that Imponderabilia took place, Galleria Comunale d'Arte Moderna of Bologna, I faced some problems in the beginning. The first difficulty was the space by itself. The Galleria Comunale d'Arte Moderna has become the MAMBo (Modern Art Museum of Bologna). Thus,



Image 3.7 Floor Plan of MAMBo (digital plan of the building in 70's and 80's

primarily I had to discover and recover the previous architectural design of the building. With the indispensable aid from the archive of MAMBo, after calling them and asking for archival material of the architectural plan, I have got the exact floor plan of the space via mail from the archive of the library of Museum of Bologna (Image 3.7). For the project's effort and actuality, I recreated the architectural space based on this plan, by inputting it in the 3ds Max as a plan.



Image 3.8 façade of Museum of Bologna nowadays with the old exterior architecture preserved

For the heights, I used the façade of the building from Google Maps (Image 3.8) and my previous knowledge on the museum architecture (as a former civil engineer) for crossexamining the exact heights. For using the photograph as a source, I replace its upper side in AutoCAD by horizontalizing and verticalizing it's façade's edges and stretch it in Photoshop under a scale 1:1 for horizontal and vertical size. The second problem was if the video documentation was captured from the interior or the exterior of the gallery. After searching and observing frame to frame the video documentation and photographic material, I found that the main video documentation was taken from the exterior of the building. This helped me to place the opened doors and the two big white temporary boxes in the exact point. After this research, I understood that the architectural details that are visible in the façade of the building on Google Earth (Image 3.9) are the same as well as the door. The designing of the space in which I would input the archive was easy; I use the interior for presenting texts of the artists, art critics, audio and video documentation and photographs. Every material has a footnote text which referring to its source. In the first experimentations I use only the first room, but the result was not expected. This material presented as an exhibition should take over more space for creating the impression of a big museum's exhibition. In the second room, there are big walls (7 meters high); space is ideal for video-projections and visual material. In the back room, I kept the



Image 3.9 architectural details from Google Earth

lights in a soft intensity (spotlights, intensity 1) and I added specifically spotlights in front of the photographs. In contrary, the first room has enough light (3 spotlights, intensity 4-6). There are also spotlights at the outdoors corridor, there where the navigation begins. The external lights were just for creating the same shadows in the bodies and the building as it is noticed in

the photographic and video archive. For enhancing a proper narration to the audience after passing between the two bodies virtually, the texts in the first room are grey (RGB 187-187-187) and in the second room pure white. Finally, I recreate the space by adding two more rooms at the back room, ready to host an extension of this archive and two more rooms in the façade of the building from the left and the right side of the entrance, based on the floor plan.



Image 3.10 3D Museum of MAMBo in process

In Mirror Check, designing the space was easier as space, it follows the ordinary gallery space design with clean surfaces and big volume spaces. It was also difficult to find where it was realized for the first time. After long research, the place was the Emanu-El (YMCA, New York). This place does not exist anymore, so I recreate the space based on the photograph, on the parameter of 30 feet distance that Jonas set and the structural data of exhibition architecture, with the height of 4.00 m. Thus, based on the instruction of Joan Jonas, I created a paper tape line (as I can find in a photograph of re-enactment), as material I photographed an old newspaper and made it seamless on Photoshop and finally increased its alpha channel. Moreover, for the archive of the performance, I create a separated side room (right side of performance), which contains texts of the artists, texts of art critic and of a foundation, one video with an interview of Joan Jonas and photographs. All the texts are in grey color (RGB 187-187-187). I kept the whole space lighted in the same way as the big amphitheatrical space of Palais de Tokyo is lighted, using my photographic and video archive of this specific room and finally immersing for observing in a more accurate way the virtual environment.

The performance Dance or Exercise on the perimeter of a Square was a performance for camera, which means that there was no audience. The result of this epitelesis13 was a videodocumentation. In the project, a glass wall is used as an alternative element to keep the audience in the requested distance and to help them understand the sensation of this performance. For a more realistic approach, I designed a glass door with metal handle as well. Moreover, there are props (video-camera and tripod)14 and the square made from paper tape sizing 1m x 1m exactly as the original performance. The square paper tape is the perimeter that the movement takes place. As a material for this paper tape, I use the same material as above without being so dramatic by increasing the alpha channel. Here, there is the third narration through the placed archive. I designed the viewer to get in the scene and begin his navigation in the space from the archive which exists in the first room (before the performance). In the left side, there are photographs of the performance from museum and collections achieves and on the opposite side (right) there is the context of the artwork and a video. I choose this place for video because there is an optical illusion of double and simultaneously movement between video and animated model, which can be sawn from the door just next to the video. The lights in the exhibition – archive room are low (spotlights, intensity 0.6-2) because of the video projection, I just kept three more spotlights to light "directly" the photographs. In the performance room, I input two spotlights over performance area for creating the same shadows as in the original and to create a light reflection in the glass and give an approximation in the sensation of the video. Moreover, in the area of virtual performance, a 3D tripod and video camera were placed. The tripod has taken from the uploading Camera.obj by Swivaller published in 13/11/2009 and the Video Camera by Hardcoredrummer, in 16/6/2010, on TurboSquid.

The already structured space of the MAMBo sets the foundations in the spatial/visual structure of the archive. The two performers will perform at the entrance, reproducing the artwork digitally. The interior space will be preserved on the basis of the architecture of the existing building structure for the placement of the archive material. The material is divided into digital and analogical two-dimensional representations of the artwork, photographs and videos, audio and text. The data of the file is imposed on the morphology of the space. For the proper reproduction of the material, initially, two rooms are created. The first room that the visitor enters through the entrance is bright. In this way, the work of art does not change form and remains faithful to its record. The second room is dark to get involved in video projections and digital material.

**IVAPA** Project

The need to extend the artillery required the creation of two additional rooms to

accommodate the new finds. Space has been preserved so that at any time it is possible to open new spaces in horizontal and vertical construction (height and width), always based on the architecture of the Italian museum, in order to fully cover the needs of its digital archive artwork.

For creating characters, there were plenty of experimentations with tools, such as MakeHuman, DAZ3d, Character Creator 3 and FaceGen. The faces that were created in FaceGen (Image 3.11) and the body builts in DAZ and Character Creator were rejected; mainly because there are no measurements and



Image 3.11 Experimenting on the face of the author in Face Gen

clear photographs of the portraits of performers from those times. The 3d models were built exclusively in MakeHuman, for having an in which I had a better view of the result. The aim was to create figures which look a lot like the performers, but not replicas of the performers; because the aim is to avoid the uncanny valley. Every model has been studied from footage



Image 3.12 Designing the face of Bruce Nauman in MakeHuman

and documentations; sketched and created, based on his/her appearance during performing the original piece. While performing Imponderabilia, Marina Abramovic and Ulay were nude. The only asset that should be added to the models were genitals. In MakeHuman Community, there is the *Flaccid Penis1* by Elvaerwyn on 03/02/2018 used to the model. The same condition was a fact at the performance of Mirror Check, Joan Jonas was nude (Image 3.13).



The clothes of Bruce Nauman are just an ordinary casual outfit composed of two black pieces. A combination of the

Image 3.13 3D Model of Joan Jonas

default clothes and an upload for the free use of MakeHuman community, titled Male Trousers 2, were used, after a re-colorization in PhotoShop with a pure black for the blouse and with a

semitransparent black (with 18% Alpha) for the trousers (Image 3.14). After finishing every model, each of them was uploaded in Mixamo for rigging and following they were animated in Motion Builder with the animation taken from MoCap (Images 3.15, 3.16 and 3.17). In Motion Builder, there was a lot to correct, especially the rotation of bones.

Realizing the compositions, including every performer in each scene, there was the direction the every scene aesthetically and visually; the lightings were designed, as it is mentioned



Image 3.14 Avatar of Bruce Nauman

above in every detail, the materials and the colors were chosen, a resize of the scales between humans and buildings by creating metric cubes in Unity (exact high of each person, exact high of the doors and for ceiling) and the texts for being readable and finally put them in their proper positions (texts on the walls, performers on their exact place). During the process of importing or changing sizes, materials, scaling, positions, there was a virtual immersion in the given area for observing and controlling the final result and correcting the dysfunctional elements.

Finally, the atmosphere, the objects, the models, the spaces and finally the sensation of every scene were investigated with the aim of correcting those that do not reflect the requested aesthetics.



Image 3.15 Avatar of Joan Jonas in Motion builder



Image 3.16 Avatar of Joan Jonas in Motion builder



Image 3.17 Avatar of Joan Jonas in Motion builder

## **Prop Design**

The performance of the prototype that was needing an extra prop was Mirror Check; a small round mirror.

#### **User's Avatar Design and Position**

In a virtual space, the avatar of visitor plays a crucial role in the accuracy of sensing the scene in actual reality term. Uncanny body: it is easier for one to get used of a not existed body, rather than a basic neutral body. Time of immersing to the environment is been shortened when the embodiment is done. The position of the visitor's avatar is in a place that is easy to understand from the beginning of his navigation.

#### Sound design

In the past, during the times of pre-conceptual art, music was a common element at the exhibition's opening. That was a fact due to the nature of the artworks which were exhibited. Nowadays, there is no music existing on the exhibitions, due to the multi-media artworks. Moreover, thinking of the phrase of McLuhan, music could influence the meaning of artwork as another additional element. So, instead of a sound, there are audios in the archive, which are in specific places for the audience's access.



Image 3.19 Imponderabilia in VR



Image 3.18 Mirror Check in VR



Image 3.21 Dance or Exercise to the perimeter of a Square in VR



Image 3.20 Imponderabilia in VR

**IVAPA** Project

#### 3.2.1.3. Feedbacks for a personal development

# First Demonstration/Presentation and Audience's Feedback – Projet Intensif

For the first demonstration, the first thing that should be done was a plan of installation and a prediction of how the audience is going to move (Image 3.23). The scale of all the spaces, models and props is realistic. Especially for the spaces, everybody who immerses to one or more scenes mention that they had the feeling of being in the actual gallery or museum space, facing the same architectural sizes and sense the same atmosphere. The feeling of passing through two nude persons in the virtual Imponderabilia is described as anxious, uncomfortable and weird. The sensation was like trying to pass through two naked persons in actual reality. The first person that was explored this performance was Cecile Welker who mentioned that it has the same sensation with the actual performance. This pre-door site is of a transitional nature, according to topoanalysis, because it temporarily hosts the next person and prepares him for the situation that follows. Between the previous course from the urban area and the next one in the controlled museum, a temporary stop is inserted. The duration of the pause is indefinite, ranging from the instantaneous change of the rate of the coming visitor to the prolonged waiting. Traditionally, the area before the main entrance has to offer a comfortable and pleasant expectation of the visitors in cases of crowded attendance or delay of members of a group. The area after the door is the place of arrival of the visitor. The audience was being annoved



Image 3.23 Basic plan for installation and visitor's movement



Image 3.22 Felix is trying the prototype

by the distance in Mirror Check, exactly as in the original performance of the artist back in 1970. Many of them tried to see through the mirror, just like in reality. In the performance Dance or Exercise on a perimeter of a Square, it was witty to use the glass as a medium symbolizing the distance that a medium is given to the audience. The public had a distance a kind of filter in approaching the performance. There are other aspects which can be overcome through this medium; the doubt of the audience. It is easier to participate or view an artwork in a virtual and protected environment. The presentation of each archive as a documentary exhibition was a pleasant surprise and helps the audience to get informed about the artwork.

## 3.2.2 New Form and Inputs in the IVAPA Project

The concept of IVAPA Project demands every single performance to be included in this archive. For the second phase, based on theoretical approaches, the space from which the visitor is going to start his navigation should be realized. Using a dystopic building idea for creating a good purpose, the idea of Colosseum reversed and instead of being in the perimeter of the spectacle now visitor is on the center. The idea is not new, researches and designs from the 15<sup>th</sup> century shewed a preference in the oldest form of the build; the circular shape. An archetypal structure as a built is this which is composed of perimetrical walls.

A relevant structure is named Panopticon.



Image 3.24 Sketch of Panopticon The works of Jeremy Bentham vol. IV, 172-3

Panopticon was an experimental structure, based on the plans of Benthamon (Image 3.24) for having total control and realized distractive psychological tests on prisoners during WWII. Here, the concept is going to be used for the user, to have the maximum control of the scene. Realizing that the person who is placed in the center, like the guard of Panopticon, psychologically feels like holding the control of the space and everything is inside it. Approaching the roundness of a hut, one of the first builds for human inhabiting, is building like the one of the Image 3.25, based on the octagon.

For shaping the plan of the space, basic shapes, like two rectangles and one octagon are used. The Octagon will give the required roundness, at the same time that will work as another observatory as the Image 3.26.

The space of Octagon is going to be used for separating the decades. Like in Image 3.25, the middle space faces 8 different directions. For the Virtual archive of IVAPA Project I used the seven of them, each one has a door (an open) and is marked at the upper side of this open/door with its decade. The visitor is free to get in every opened room and explore the performances. Thus, every room would contain many performances of the specific decade, there is a trigger near every performance; visitor who decides to visit an exact performance gets on the trigger and teleports to the beginning of each performance artwork's room. At the rooms of each performance, there is an exit for getting back to the main space of IVAPA. The eighth side is a wide corridor which connects the



Image 3.25 Armour-Stiner House. Source: Sarah, Dazzling 1860's Octagon House in New York State. 2012, Digital Image.



Image 3.26 Observatory Plan: Armour-Stiner House. Source: Joseph Pell Lombardi Architects (2004), Digital Image.

octagonal space with the rectangular. In the rectangular space is the archive of this archive (IVAPA's). Video, photographs, texts, the logo, and the QR code is included there as well as for instructions of navigation to the user. The instructions are given like a common text on the wall, for keeping a mutual aesthetic. Inside this rectangular room, at the opposite wall of the octagonal space, there is also a door indicated with the text IVAPA School/Academy. It is a closed space for activities and e-learning. The possibilities are still in the level of research for a virtual academy. One solution could be the simple demonstration of body exercises specialized for performers; a study of the author that was presented as a talk at Athens School of Fine Arts in 2017.

As mentioned above, there is text again as the first phases of the prototype. For the new scenes, the TextMesh Pro was imported from the Asset Store. Using the Multi-Line Text Mesh Pro for the texts. A matter of color. For Changing color in specific parts of the text like the introducing text of IVAPA Project, the words "IVAPA Project" was scheduled to be on a different color to black. Thus, it was written in red and bold fonts,

#### <b><#ff0000>IVAPA Project</color></b>

relatively, the quotation of the author in italic and the link below with the official blue color, indicating URLs (Image 3.27).



Image 3.27 TextMesh Coloring text, printscreen

The research and experimentation in important performance artworks were necessary for the archive's expansion. Until now, captures and experimentations were related to artworks performed in the interior, with the exception of *Imponderabilia*, which was carried out at the boundary between indoor and outdoor. An interesting experiment would be the study of a performance that took place outside. The interest could also be found in studying artworks where it is evident the use of prosthetic members as extensions of the human body. Moreover, it is demanding for the project to include the re-enacted second part of the square performances of Bruce Nauman.

Thus, the next studies would be *Roadworks* of Mona Hatoum, *Scratching Both Walls at Once* by Rebecca Horn and *Walking in an Exaggerated Manner* of Bruce Nauman.

71

## 1.1.1.1. Performance "Roadworks" – Mona Hatoum



Image 3.28 Mona Hatoum, Roadworks

The artwork of Mona Hatoum Roadworks is a public performance, held back in 1985 in a commission of Brixton Art Gallery to young artists.<sup>61</sup> The model of Mona Hatoum is tended to walk barefoot for the virtual project. As the avatar was being modeled in

MakeHuman, a realization came up; there were no toenails. For this reason, a search was held in the Assets of MakeHuman Community, where one can find assets, like nails. The nails that are chosen is Submitted by Mindfront on 02/15/2018 and it can be found at the http://www.makehumancommunity.org/comment/994#comment-994.



Image 3.29 3d model of Mona Hatoum



Image 3.30 Nail by Mindfort

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>61</sup> http://www.li-ma.nl/lima/catalogue/art/mona-hatoum/roadworks/8990#
Originally, she was wearing black clothes. For the 3d avatar, the "female yoga", a black shirt and tight from the category clothes of MakeHuman Community, were used. There was a re-colorization of the given in Photoshop for having a black set.



Image 3.31 outside of the new gallery, Google Earth

For imitating the public environment of the Brixton of midst '80s, the same way with the designing of Imponderabilia was followed. There was the first view and "walk" through Google Earth, just on the pavement of the block that the former Brixton Art Gallery was, facing the Image 3.31 ("Google Maps - Brixton" 2019).

The neighborhood seems to be quite Britannic. But the video documentation of Li-ma archive approves that performance did not hold in front of the gallery, but across a pavement in front of a series of old stores.

There is a small building, offered at TurboSquid, which has English elements and it has a shop on the ground floor, uploaded from the user. This unit was copied and synthesis was created for the given build. At the opposite side of the road, a big building was covering the road with its shadow. There were some additional elements on the buildings, like glasses on some of the windows and some wooden boxes and pallets at this side.<sup>62</sup>

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>62</sup> The asset Pallet was uploaded by Ringo3D in 7/6/2015 and Wooden Boxes Pack FREE by ivanzubak in 10/11/2016, both of them in TurboSquid

For having big buildings there were downloaded and used the European Building 009A and the European Building 112 by 3DMarco uploaded at TurboSquid at 9/5/2012 and 26/6/2014, in royalty-free license and for all extended uses.



Image 3.32 the first design

Moreover, the environment has cylindric street lights (Street Lamp Set by MrSmive, uploaded in 2/3/2008) and Fire Hydrants (design by Sabra8, and uploaded in 4/2/2016) as well on a pavement which was borrowed from the Street Terror by MetaBallStudios in 12/11/2015. All the assets were downloaded from Turbosquid. Moreover, wooden boxes were added as well as a realistic skybox with clouds.

For recreating the previous form of Brixton Art Gallery, there was not a lot of information. Digging in archives and magazines, there was held an exhibition in 1984, titled "1984- I have paid for it.". Participant artists used the gallery's plan for their exhibition's poster (Image 3.33), which is the only footage remaining on the web. The design of the gallery was based on this document and was realized using this plan as a plane in 3DsMax (Image 3.34).



Image 3.33 Poster of exhibition "1984 – I had paid for it"



Image 3.34 Working the 3d gallery in 3ds max

For the purposes of the reenactment, physically, I use my own boots for having the same walking experiences through difficulties that Mona Hatoum faced once at the walk sides of Brixton. The performance was made under the concept of walking barefoot on the urban ground; thus, it was preferable for its accuracy to be barefoot as well.



Image 3.35 and Image 3.36 from video-documentations of reenactment in the laboratory of ATI

Firstly, there was some experimentation in the lab, but for creating the animation in the virtual environment a longer movement (in meters) is needed. The outer corridor was used for having a movement in a straight line.

The project indicates the utilize of boots (DocMartens). A quick search on the internet was not infective. There was no accurate 3d model of the specific boots; in fact, the boots which are already existing in repositories (like TurboSquid, Asset Store, etc) are not the actual model of shoes that Mona Hatoum used (Image 3.27). The solution for this is to create this piece from the beginning. An accurate solution is a photogrammetry or 3d



Image 3.37 First try to create the boot in RealityCapture

scanning. The RealityCapture was used to recreate the boot prop in this virtual performance. It was chosen for the reason for the project because of the models of. For this reason, a new pair

of shoes was bought from Doc Martens Shop at Chatelet (Paris). Now, it is possible to have through the photogrammetric process the same model that the artist used in her performance back in 1985. The product is really important here, because of these exact shoes represent a big social variation, as Hatoum mentioned.

In the first approach, the experimentation took place in a private space. The laces were kept in the internal space of the boots for adding chain-laces in unity, which are going to connect the feet of Mona Hatoum's virtual body with the 3D boots. The result was quite disappointing (Image 3.37). There were many surfaces let as holes in the final model. It should be recaptured under better conditions. Based on Neufert's book the light must have an ambient type and space should be empty of objects, reflected surfaces, and visual noise. Another space was used for the second experimentation. The light was not a led light, which creating areas of line-lighting and space were clean. Moreover, a sheet of paper (A4 size) was used at the bottom of boots as clear ground for having a more accurate result. The number of the photographs was multiplied; also, there were two extra height perimeters for capturing the object as the Image 3.38 indicates. The workflow is the following:

Workflow  $\rightarrow$  Inputs, Alignment  $\rightarrow$  Align Images, Reconstruction  $\rightarrow$  Normal Detail/High Detail.

At the end of metering 344 photographs for this test and applying a time demanding High Detail Reconstruction, the result was the 3D Object of Figure ##. For having the object in an appropriate form, lighter in low poly shape, a retopology applied in the prior model at 3DsMax.



Image 3.38 Second try in RealityCapture

#### 3.2.3 Feedback of users for the development

### 3.2.3.1. Visitors

The Second Demonstration/Presentation of the project held in the framework of Laval Virtual 2019. After submitting the project in the open call and be chosen by curator of the exhibition "Illusions Rellee | Illusions Virtuelle", Judith Guez.

Before leaving for Laval there was a lot of hours of panning the installation and the visitor's experience, especially for the ones that would not wear the headset at the time that somebody else is in the environment. At the first presentation, there was only the screen of a laptop and it was difficult for the audience to see what was going on. Thus, a projection or a screening of a user's view was necessary; a projector gave the solution. Now, everybody could see through the eyes of the temporary user at the same time that everyone can see the user moving across the actual and virtual space, just like being in an exhibition.

For this festival, the installation of laptop, projector and VR Headset should be realized for having a nice image of the existing objects. For this reason, a box, made of white foam-board, was constructed for containing the projector and having the appearance of a single structure, merged with podiums. All the other objects<sup>63</sup> were put on the wooden stands/podiums. The first structure was for the 4 first days of the exhibition. While the 5<sup>th</sup> day the project was moved to a bigger empty space. Both of the installing plans were studied for having the optimal space utilization as well as the better kinetic use by visitors, based on the architectural principles of Neufert (1970)



Image 3.39 IVAPA Project first installing experimentat Lanal Vierual festival 2019

about human movements and the existing virtual environments. In a first experiment the

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>63</sup> laptop, cables, headset

projection was upon the installation (Image 3.39), but due to the people who would pass the projection would have faced problems and obstacles. Thus, a "tower" for supporting projector was installed back from the laptop. Then, the projection would have been at the opposite side and could have been visible for people who were entering the room. The second plan was the final one for the 1<sup>st</sup> installation.

For the second room (Image 3.40), there were no space limitations because all its space was dedicated to IVAPA Project.



*Image 3.40 IVAPA Project* – 2<sup>nd</sup> room



#### Image 3.41 IVAPA Project, Statement

In both of the rooms, there was the artistic statement on the show (Image 3.41) as well as the QR code and cards of the Project. Plus, there was an additional intervention at the length of the festival, promotional material at the table; there where exhibitors put their material for the audience.

During Real Illusions exhibition of Laval Virtual festival 2019, the opportunity of listening users/visitors speaking about their experience in the environment of IVAPA was enormous. Every participant was asked at the end to describe his/her experience by giving live and spontaneously their report, their feedback. It was a very interesting process for understanding the audiences' engagement.

More than 140 people tested IVAPA Project prototype and navigated themselves in the virtual environments of the three performances. They preferred mostly Imponderabilia for few reasons that were recorded; it is more interactive than the others, it is very provocative for their 'taste' so challenging for them to experience, and finally, it has been created by one of the two artists who are really well-known and audience wants to learn more about this performance artwork. Furthermore, many of the art-lovers were already familiar with this performance and had read some articles or had seen some pictures of this performance.

Many people were enthusiastic about learning the story of police officers had arrested the two performers for public nudity while they were performing the artwork during the opening of the exhibition.

People were mentioning the realistic scale of mambo museum, models and props. Museumlike experience.

Some of them tried to find an alternative to get into the museum, without passing or 'touching' the two bodies. Some of them did it, by walking physically through the wall.

An interesting point was the interactions and feedbacks of people familiar with new media, parts of the digital art scene; like Marie-Helene Tramus, Etienne Armand, Etienne Pereny, Marguerite Bergamo, Daniel Gonzales, etc.



Image 3.42 Artist, researcher, and curator Judith Guez in Imponderabilia 2019 © Athina Kanellopoulou



Image 3.43 Marie-Helene Tramus and Michel Bret experiencing the archive 2019 © Athina Kanellopoulou



Image 3.44 Choreographer Margherita Bergamo is testing IVAPA



Image 3.45 Digital artist David is passing through the two virtual performers.



Image 3.46 Dionysis Zamplaras is exploring Imponderabilia



Image 3.47 IVAPA Project Axel's exploration in Imponderabilia Environment



Image 3.48 Student from Universite Montpellier



*Image 3.49* Etienne Pereny is walking through the two virtual bodies



Image 3.50 Visitors are waiting to experience one of the performances 2019 © Athina Kanellopoulou



Image 3.51 Visitors are waiting to experience one of the performances 2019 © Athina Kanellopoulou

In the meanwhile, a notebook was used for keeping notes and asking for visitors to textualize their experience. There are four texts from the notebook below.

tios intéressante mise en scène virhelle de la performance. On ressent la présence des 2 corps. Sensation étrange. L'installation pose la question des réactions à cette virtuelle performance, par rapport au réel. Des comportements qui changent avec le virtuel -Norci ! Judith

Image 3.52 Text of Judith Guez

Bonjour! thank you for letting metraying your experience it's great. Thank you to reduce this great, dea. I'm a great for of Alarmous and I can say firming I experiences here tomous istellation somehow ... It's vieture but it's giving we the some entertain exhibition moment in front of the two hated bodies, it recreates a strong doubt and feelings. I also loved you choised to represent on evihibition place with protures and videos in the VR environment, it's a pleasure to find blen, kisses! Marchereita

Image 3.53 Text of Margherita Bergamo

HI nice to meet You Guys. I Love You nice works what I Liked the most is your beautitul encry. About the experience .... Sensation of being equal ... no explicit need to take a choice F explored the served eyes and Your decition to slave at these eyes. Also East the se wanted to explore the impossible (but maybenot for the medium) Action of storing the eyes of both at the senetime Also repplaced the idea of embodied rembodiment in the figures. that's bestiful Donial G

Image 3.54 Text of Gonzales Daniel

Luxtaenendria fic zin napavolia Gas 600 genus rescibed have Vitual Recto VRSO 2019 Eirai rioló Enfancino un Eucuxés TION ETIICUXATERE 62 robo privés poviné Sidonja L'experience est très intéressante c'est une belle opportunité d' explorer notre perception des illusions dans le virtuel. Bravo et bane continuation. AIONDENS

Image 3.55 Text of Zamplaras Dionysis

3.2.3.2. Press

Gladly, in Laval Virtual festival 2019 there were opportunities of having a deep focus by the press in the projects. Thus, art-director of the international art e-magazine dreamideamachine.com Efi Michalarou covered the exhibition by writing an article (Michalarou 2019) for the projects of the exhibition Real Illusions that were preferable for their aesthetic criteria, noting IVAPA in this category and asking for photographs and more info about the project.

In a second article, art-journalist Dimitris Lempesis of dreamideamachine.com again focused on IVAPA project and wrote some thoughts and critic (Lempesis 2019).

In the midst of March, I was called to give an interview at the director Efi Michalarou about the concept and the story of IVAPA project.

### **3.3 Website of IVAPA**

The choice is to keep the two reversed appearances of the Logo; black logo with white background and versa, white logo on black background. The main logo is the black logo and fonts on a white background. The idea was to create a circle around the text, symbolizing the intensity and the field of the project.



Image 3.56 Ivapa logo (White background) © Athina Kanellopoulou



Image 3.57 IVAPA logo (black background) © Athina Kanellopoulou

The aim of the project is to be developed as an open research tool, with a direct respect to the Fluxus manifesto's 5<sup>th</sup> assignment about the art's openness to the public ("5 Fluxus Assignments To Get Your Mojo Flowing" 2013). A new genre of archiving performance art. That is the reason why the project was chosen to be publicly approached by entering at its

webpage https://athinakanellopoulo.wixsite.com/ivapa

Moreover, each exe is downloadable for realizing the ideal situation of bringing the art-piece in user's place; thus, the term visitor referring to the user is not as accurate in this new condition.

For quick access in the site, the is a QR code (Image ##) created, which was in two different visible and easy to access places at the exhibition.



Image 3.58 Ivapa's webpage QR

For presenting the prototype two videos were created. Link of the representational: <u>https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=cBRO6iuEdLY</u>



Image 3.59 Website

### **3.4 Pre-conclusion**

### 3.4.1 Next steps

This project is an open and on-going project by its nature as an archive. The next steps are related to the following actions: finishing the improvisations (space, props, animation) in every performance room, importing new material and including new studies, such as Francis Alys' *Paradox of Praxis 1* (or *Sometimes making something leads to nothing*) (1997), *Tree of Life* (1976) and *Body Tracks* (1974) of Ana Mendieta, Carolee Schneemann's *Interior Scroll* (1975), and some interactive performances as well such as *Rhythm 0* (1974) and *The Artist is Present* (2010) of Marina Abramovic or *Cut Piece* (1965) of Yoko Ono.

#### 3.4.2 Re-enactment Limitations

For performing or re-enacting with mocap suit it is necessary to act away from an electromagnetic field. Thus, performances like *Con I* and *Con II* (Image 3.60), which I performed at Tsepelovo Art Space of ASFA in the framework of Soundscape Workshop of

Taxiarchis Diamantopoulos (Athens School of Fine Arts), are difficult to be captured due to the huge electromagnetic field. This means that many sensors (neurons) are going to be uncalibrated and a loose and full of bugs movement is coming as a result.

Also, there are many performance artworks which could cause damage to the equipment. For example, it is difficult to capture performances involving water, such as *Red Flux* (2012, Switzerland) of Elvira Santamaria



Image 3.60 Athina Kanellopoulou, Con II. 2018

Torres<sup>64</sup>, the participatory performance of Zhang Huan *To Raise the Water Level in a Fish Pond* (1997, Beijing) or Ana Mendieta's *Ocean Bird* (*Washup*) (1974).

The answer for small scale projects including water was given by Acute Art which is the team realizing the performance of Marina Abramovic *Rising* in VR (as it was mentioned in the 1<sup>st</sup> chapter). The performance was including the sinking of Abramovic in a glass tank of water. They used action cameras for tracking the movement of the performer in the tank. (Image 3.61 and 3.62). But until now there is no one captured performance in 3d at a bigger water field.

The other difficult parameter is carrying heavy and dangerous for the suit objects, like the big tree branches for *Equilibria* – *Act I, II, III* (Image 3.63)<sup>65</sup>

Finalizing this section with the taste and the priorities, it is not the first thought to reenact heavy bodily performances like Roy



Image 3.62 Marina Abramovic, Rising. 2018.



Image 3.61 Marina Abramovic, Rising. 2018.

Athey's artworks. Could not be reproduced based in the realistic re-enactment, because it should be a research in 3D physics of fluids and blood pressure, but mostly, I do not want to get involved in such a performance. As well as political acts such as Petr Pavlensky's Separation, in which he cut his left earlobe off with a big knife, as an act of protest.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>64</sup> <u>http://water-wheel.net/media\_items/view/1678</u>

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>65</sup> Forest of Boullon, 2019



Image 3.64 Athina Kanellopoulou, Equilibria – Act I, II, III. 2019 © Athina Kanellopoulou



Image 3.63 VR space of Roadworks

### Conclusion

Through this study, the environment of virtual reality was investigated as an area for the creation of experiential archives, and in this case an archive of performance art. Nowadays, it is possible to archive and re-enact performance through virtual reality due to the development of technology. A virtual archive has the ability to reproduce its data in a form compatible with the representative theory of mind, similar to the structured world, based on specific architectural disciplines (Neufert) and urban structures, natural landscapes, and every natural phenomenon (for example the gravity). Thus, works of art are preserved and reshowcased/demonstrated. The immersion of the visitor can be realized at any time, from any place. Also, they can be featured in an art show, in the same way as the Laval Virtual Festival.

From this experience, the feedback of IVAPA's Project visitors indicates that the use of virtual reality is ideal for experiences with physical functions. Designing a geometrically familiar environment helps navigate the visitor and makes his/her experience stronger. Thus, the audience can have a full experience of each performance art piece. Moreover, researchers can experience the same performance art piece by testing it in the virtual space rather than reperforming by themselves. Also, performance artists can practice performing art skills through re-enacting and experiencing each performance art piece.

Finally, the virtual reality environment is suited to the field of education (Packer 2013); the visitor has the curiosity to explore the whole structured space, to see all the information and to experience his visit as much as possible. For this reason, the parallel extension of the project to an educational direction is being investigated.

The nature of the IVAPA Project underlines an ongoing process under a specific aesthetics. Every time an artist produces and performs a new artwork there should be a new placement in the archive; which is time-demanding, but interesting and significant for the preservation of cultural heritage as well as joyful and creative experience for the creator. This project has no telos, but definitely a strict goal. The archives are the guards of memory and realized ideas, while "memory is the salvation of the senses", as Plato mentions (Loulos, 2015). This means that without a recorded memory there would be no term evolution, so neither the meaning of Art.

### **Bibliography**

Abramović, Marina. 2017. The Cleaner.

Archias, Elise. 2016. The concrete body: Yvonne Rainer, Carolee Schneemann, Vito Acconci.

Artaud, Antonin, Victor Corti, and Antonin Artaud. 2014. The theatre and its double.

Bachelard, Gaston. 1958. The Poetics Of Space.

Berghaus, Günter. 2010. *Theatre, performance, and the historical avant-garde*. New York: Palgrave Macmillan.

Birringer, Johannes H. 2008. *Performance, technology, & science*. New York (N.Y.): PAJ Publications.

Birringer, Johannes. 2012. *Bauhaus, Constructivism, Performance*. Design and Performance Lab at Brunel University, London.

Body of art. 2015. London: Phaidon Press.

Borggreen, Gunhild, and Rune Gade. 2013. *Performing archives - archives of performance*. Copenhagen: Museum Tusculanum Press.

Bosman, Philip. Selling Cynicism: The Pragmatics of Diogenes' Comic Performances. Academia.

Broadhurst, S., Price, S. Digital Bodies; creativity and technology in the arts and humanities. Palgrave Macmillan. 2017, UK

Bukhari, Kyle. 2017. *Movements of Media in Yvonne Rainer's Hand Movie (1966) and Richard Serra's Hand Catching Lead (1968)*. The International Journal of Screendance 8.

Carr, C. 2012. On Edge. Middletown: Wesleyan University Press.

Caws, Mary Ann. 2001. *Manifesto: a century of isms*. Lincoln: University of Nebraska Press. Coeure, S., Duclert, V. 2011. Les archives. Editions La Decouverte. Paris

Danchev, Alex. 2011. 100 artists' manifestos: from the futurists to the stuckists. London: Penguin.

Davis, Tracy C. 2012. *Cambridge companion to performance studies*. Cambridge, England: ProQuest LLC.

Dickie, G. 1974. Art and the Aesthetic: An Institutional Analysis. Ithaca, NY: Cornell

University Press.

*Digital Bodies: creativity and technology in the arts and humanities.* 2018. [S.I.]: Palgrave Macmillan.

Digital performance. 2002. Paris: Anomos.

Dirmoser, Gerhard, Nieslony, Boris. 2014. Performance Art Kontext. Performance Research v06. 2014/08/05. publishers Taylor & Francis, Taylor & Francis.

Ellis, T. O., J. F. Heafner, and W. L. Sibley, The Grail Project: An Experiment in Man-Machine Communications. Santa Monica, CA: RAND Corporation, 1969.

Freud, S. (1997) Writings on Art and Literature, Stanford, California, 341

Goldberg, RoseLee. 1979. Performance: Live Art 1909 to the Present. Harry N. Abrams. Inc Publishers, New York

Goldberg, RoseLee. 1998. Performance: Live Art Since 1960, Harry N. Abrams, NY

Goldberg, RoseLee. 1999. Performances: l'art en action. London: Thames and Hudson.

Goldberg, RoseLee. 2001. *La performance: du futurisme à nos jours*. Paris: Thames & Hudson.

Gómez-Peña, Guillermo, Roberto Sifuentes, and Rachel Rogers. 2011. *Exercises for rebel artists: radical performance pedagogy*. London: Routledge Taylor & Francis Group.

Goodman, N. 1974. Languages of Art. Hackett Publishing Company.

Griffin, Jonathan, Paul Harper, David Trigg, and Eliza Williams. 2014. *The Twenty First Century Art Book*.

Heathfield, Adrian, and Hugo Glendinning. 2012. Live: art and performance.

Jones, A. 2006. *A Companion to Contemporary Art Since 1945*. Blackwell Publishing, Ltd Kanellopoulou, Athina. 2016. *The Poetics of Memory*.

Karmel, Pepe. 2000. *Jackson Pollock: interviews, articles and reviews*. New York: Museum of Modern Art.

Leeker, Martina, Imanuel Schipper, and Timon Beyes. 2017. *Performing the digital: performativity and performance studies in digital cultures*.

Manovich, Lev. (2002). The language of new media. Cambridge, Mass: MIT Press.

Marvin, C. 1996. *Performance: A Critical Introduction*. London and New York, Routledge Neufert, Ernst, Peter Neufert, Johannes Kister, David Sturge, and Mathias Brockhaus. 2015. *Architects' data*.

O'Reilly, Sally. 2015. *The body in contemporary art*. London: Thames & Hudson. Packer, Randall, Ken Jordan, William Gibson, and Laurie Anderson. 2006. *Multimedia: from Wagner to virtual reality*. New York: W.W. Norton & Company.

Popper, Frank. 2007. From Technological to Virtual Art. MIT Press.

Poulain-Beaufils, Eliane, and Eva Holling. 2018. *Being-with in contemporary performing arts*.

Townsend, Chris, Alex Trott, and Rhys Davies. 2014. Across the great divide: modernism's intermedialities, from futurism to Fluxus.

Wellman, Henry M. 2017. "The Development of Theory of Mind: Historical Reflections". *Child Development Perspectives*. 11 (3)

Yudina, Anna. 2017. *Multiverse: art, dance, design, technology - the emergent creation*. Milano: 5 Continents Editions.

Zarrilli, Phillip B., and Peter Hulton. 2009. *Psychophysical acting: an intercultural approach after Stanislavski*. London: Routledge.

Zweite, Armin, Schmidt, Katharina, von Drathen, Doris, and others. 2006. *Rebecca Horn: Drawings, Sculptures, Installations, Films 1964–2006*, Ostfildern.

# Webography

"5 Fluxus Assignments To Get Your Mojo Flowing". 2013. *Masterdabblers*. https://masterdabblers.wordpress.com/2013/08/01/5-fluxus-assignments-to-get-your-mojo-flowing/.

"Archive – Art Term | Tate". 2019. *Tate*. https://www.tate.org.uk/art/art-terms/a/archive. [Accessed 3 March 2019].

"Archive | Definition Of Archive In English By Oxford Dictionaries". 2019. *Oxford Dictionaries | English*. https://en.oxforddictionaries.com/definition/archive. [Accessed 3 March 2019].

"Archive". 2019. *En.Wikipedia.Org*. https://en.wikipedia.org/wiki/Archive. [Accessed 5 February 2019].

"Artspace". 2019. Artspace. https://www.artspace.com. [accessed 30 March 2019]

"Behind The Curtain". 2015. *Behind The Curtain*. https://behindthecurtainfeminism.wordpress.com. [accessed 4 March 2019]

"Bezoek Het Museum Over Vincent Van Gogh - In Amsterdam - Van Gogh Museum". 2019. *Vangoghmuseum.Nl.* http://www.vangoghmuseum.nl. [Accessed 15 March 2019].

"Biennale Arte 2019 | Homepage 2019". 2018. *La Biennale Di Venezia*. https://www.labiennale.org/en/art/2019/. [Accessed 5 April 2019].

"E-Flux". 2019. E-Flux.Com. https://www.e-flux.com. [accessed 25 January 2019]

"Eva And Franco Mattes > 0100101110101101.ORG". 2019. 0100101110101101.Org. http://www.0100101110101101.org. [Accessed 3 January 2019].

"Explore Sigmund Freud's House, London In 3D". 2019. Matterport. https://my.matterport.com/show/?m=KxpJwLTPD3A&utm\_source=1&fbclid=IwAR0YzYyJ \_7j9p\_WeQdbKpnV6yH\_1XZOPEjYsBaLNzwYwNcNh2hJEOiMYRBY. [Accessed 22 December 2018]. "Google Maps - Brixton". 2019. Google Maps.

https://www.google.com/maps/place/Brixton+Art+Gallery/@51.4632343,-0.1125553,3a,75y,31.67h,88.58t/data=!3m7!1e1!3m5!1sVQ7WOr\_z2dPfBGPA4AtQw!2e0!6s%2F%2Fgeo0.ggpht.com%2Fcbk%3Fpanoid%3DVQ7WOr\_z2dPfBGPA4AtQw%26output%3Dthumbnail%26cb\_client%3Dsearch.TACTILE.gps%26thumb %3D2%26w%3D86%26h%3D86%26yaw%3D272.01944%26pitch%3D0%26thumbfov%3D 100!7i13312!8i6656!4m8!1m2!2m1!1sbrixton+art+gallery!3m4!1s0x4876046616fe10ab:0xf 18069c4a85d4d42!8m2!3d51.4632335!4d-0.1126229.

"How The Bauhaus School Gave Life To... Performance Art Movement!". 2019. *Widewalls*. https://www.widewalls.ch/bauhaus-school-performance-art/. [accessed 2 March 2019]

"Internet Archive: Digital Library Of Free & Borrowable Books, Movies, Music & Wayback Machine". 2019. *Archive.Org.* https://archive.org/. [Accessed 1 February 2019].

"Marina Abramovic - Acute Art". 2018. Acute Art. https://acuteart.com/artist/marinaabramovic/. [Accessed 19 March 2019].

"Medien Kunst Netz | Homepage". 2019. *Medienkunstnetz.De*. http://www.medienkunstnetz.de. [accessed March 11, 2019]

"Memory Of The World". 2019. *UNESCO*. https://en.unesco.org/programme/mow. [Accessed 2 April 2019].

"Modernism". 2005. *Google Books*. Available at: https://books.google.fr/books?id=p1qso99TB6IC&pg=PA37&lpg=PA37&dq=the+solemn,+t he+sacred,+the+serious+and+the+sublime+in+Art+futurism&source=bl&ots=C0JAAzYfy6 &sig=ACfU3U3W7pHeTX4LWKQUBvn2bEwwUgvI-Q&hl=el&sa=X&ved=2ahUKEwiPh7ySroriAhWz6uAKHRJnDUUQ6AEwA3oECAMQAQ [Accessed 1 April 2019].

"Oxford Dictionaries | The World's Most Trusted Dictionary Provider". 2019. *Oxford Dictionaries*. https://www.oxforddictionaries.com/. [Accessed 3 March 2019].

"Performance Art – Art Term | Tate". 2019. *Tate*. https://www.tate.org.uk/art/art-terms/p/performance-art. [Accessed 1 April 2019].

"Performance Artists Digital Video Art Performing Arts Gallery Art". 2019. *Performanceartist.Com.* http://performanceartist.com. [accessed January 8, 2019] http://www.artmag.gr

"Performance". 2019. *Moma.Org*. https://www.moma.org/collection/terms/109. [Accessed 3 March 2019].

"PROJECTS". 2019. *Veniceperformanceart.Org*. https://veniceperformanceart.org/. [accessed 4 January 2019]

"Rhizome". 2019. Rhizome. http://rhizome.org/community/24198/.

"Social Sculpture – Art Term | Tate". 2019. *Tate*. https://www.tate.org.uk/art/art-terms/s/social-sculpture. [Accessed 30 March 2019].

"The Definition Of Archive". 2019. Www.Dictionary.Com. [Accessed 3 March 2019].

"The Orgies Mysteries Theatre, Nitsch.Org". 2019. *Nitsch.Org*. Available at: http://www.nitsch.org/en/aktionen/. [Accessed 5 April 2019]

"Unique 3D Model Of Notre Dame Cathedral Could Help Reconstruction Efforts". 2019. *Euronews*. https://www.euronews.com/2019/04/18/unique-3d-model-of-notre-dame-cathedral-could-help-reconstruction-efforts. [Accessed 28 April 2019].

"What Are Archives? | International Council On Archives". 2019. *Ica.Org*. https://www.ica.org/en/what-archive. [Accessed 3 March 2019].

"What Is Digital Reality? | Digital Reality Consulting". 2019. *Digitalreality.Guru*. http://digitalreality.guru/what-is-digital-reality/. [Accessed 12 March 2019].

"Hermann Nitsch Biography". Abc-arte. Available at: https://www.abcarte.com/en/artists/44-hermann-nitsch/biography/ [Accessed 2 April 2019].

"Movement Fluxus". The Art History. Avaliable at: https://www.theartstory.org/movement-fluxus.htm [Accessed 5 April 2019]

Allan Kaprow. http://www.allankaprow.co- official website [accessed March 8, 2019]

Artperformance.Org. http://www.artperformance.org. [Accessed 5 January 2019].

Balasegaram, Gowri. 2017. "Wei-Ling Gallery | Ivan Lam – Curating Human Experiences
66:06:06 – Press Release". *Weiling-Gallery.Com.* http://weilinggallery.com/gallery/portfolio-item/ivan-lam-human-experiences-660606-press-release/.
[Accessed 9 April 2019].

Bosman, Philip. 2006. "Selling Cynicism: The Pragmatics Of Diogenes' Comic Performances". *Academia.Edu* https://www.academia.edu/1094497/Selling\_Cynicism\_The\_pragmatics\_of\_Diogenes\_comic \_performances. [Accessed 22 April 2019].

Craig, Emory. 2018. "Virtual Reality Artist Live Performance At The Louvre Museum, Paris | VR, AR And AI | Digital Bodies". *VR, AR And AI | Digital Bodies*. https://www.digitalbodies.net/virtual-reality/virtual-reality-artist-live-performance-at-thelouvre-museum-paris/. [Accessed 18 February 2019].

Ellis, T. O., J. F. Heafner, and W. L. Sibley, The Grail Project: An Experiment in Man-Machine Communications. Santa Monica, CA: RAND Corporation, 1969. https://www.rand.org/pubs/research\_memoranda/RM5999.html. [Accessed 7 April 2019].

Gibson, William. 2013. "Disneyland With The Death Penalty". *WIRED*. https://www.wired.com/1993/04/gibson-2. [Accessed 14 February 2019].

Haberer, L. *Marina Abramovic / Ulay, Imponderabilia 1977*. Available at: http://www.newmedia-art.org/cgi-bin/show-oeu.asp?ID=ML002604&lg=GBR [accessed January 8, 2019]

Harris, J. (2018). *How is performance art different from the performing arts?*. Experimental Action. Available at: https://www.experimentalaction.com/single-post/2018/01/22/How-is-performance-art-different-from-the-performing-arts [Accessed 11 February 2019].

http://www.vangoghmuseum.nl

https://www.dictionary.com/browse/archive. [Accessed 3 March 2019].

Jeffery, C. (2015). *The artist as curator*. Bristol: Intellect. Available at: https://issuu.com/tina9214/docs/celina\_jeffery-the\_artist\_as\_curato [Accessed 8 January 2019]. Kanellopoulou, Athina. 2016. "The Poetics Of Memory". https://www.academia.edu/s/4bb4c009f9/%CE%B7-%CF%80%CE%BF%CE%B9%CE%B7%CF%84%CE%B9%CE%BA%CE%AE-%CF%84%CE%B7%CF%82-%CE%BC%CE%BD%CE%AE%CE%BC%CE%B7%CF%82-the-poetics-of-memory. [Accessed 3 March 2019].

Klein, Y. (n.d.). *Accueil - Yves Klein*. [online] Yvesklein.com. Available at: http://www.yvesklein.com/ [Accessed 9 March 2019]

Kulenović, S. (2017). *How the Bauhaus School Gave Life to… Performance Art Movement!*". Widewalls E-magazine. Available at: https://www.widewalls.ch/bauhaus-school-performance-art/ [Accessed 10 February 2019].

Kuzmanovic, Maja, and Xin Wei Sha. 2017. "From Representation To Performance: Responsive Public Space".

https://www.academia.edu/499178/\_%CE%91%CF%80%CF%8C\_%CF%84%CE%B7%CE %BD\_%CE%91%CE%BD%CE%B1%CF%80%CE%B1%CF%81%CE%AC%CF%83%CF %84%CE%B1%CF%83%CE%B7\_%CF%83%CF%84%CE%B7%CE%BD\_%CE%95%CF %80%CE%B9%CF%84%CE%AD%CE%BB%CE%B5%CF%83%CE%B7\_From\_Represen tation\_to\_Performance\_. [accessed January 30, 2019]

Li-ma Archive. *Marina Abramovic / Ulay, Imponderabilia 1977*. Available at: http://www.li-ma.nl/site/catalogue/art/abramovic-ulay/imponderabilia-1977/7094 [Accessed 8 January 2019].

Lussac, O. (2013). *Mirror Check @ Joan Jonas*. 1970. Artperformance. www.artperformance.org/article-30265806.html [accessed January 10, 2019]

Manatakis, L. 2019. *Remembering Carolee Schneemann, In Her Own Words. Dazed.* Available at: https://www.dazeddigital.com/art-photography/article/43643/1/remembering-carolee-schneemann-in-her-own-words. [Accessed 8 March 2019].

McLuhan, Marshall. 1967. "Full Text Of "Marshall Mcluhan - The Medium Is The Massage.Pdf (Pdfy Mirror)"". *Archive.Org.* https://archive.org/details/pdfy-vNiFct6b-L5ucJEa. [Accessed 31 January 2019].

Michalarou, Efi. 2019. "ART-PRESENTATION: Illusion Réelle / Illusion Virtuelle". Dreamideamachine.Com. http://www.dreamideamachine.com/en/?p=46409.

Neufert, Ernst. 1970. "Architect's Data". Academia.edu https://www.academia.edu/21246356/Ernst\_Neufert\_ARCHITECTS\_DATA. [Accessed 13 January 2019].

Ottmann, K. (2002). *The Art of Happenstance: The Performative Sculptures of James Lee Byars*. Sculpture. November 2002. Vol 21, No 9. A publication of the International Sculpture Center. Available at: https://www.sculpture.org/documents/scmag02/nov02/byars/byars.shtml [Accessed 7 March 2019].

Packer, Randall. 2013. "Future Tense: Education In A Third Space - Zakros Interarts". *Zakros Interarts*. https://zakros.com/future-tense-education-in-a-third-space/.[Accessed 25 April 2019].

Ralphmag.org. (n.d.). *The First Be-In --- 1952 | John Cage and the 'Untitled Event' | Black Mountain College*. [online] Available at: http://www.ralphmag.org/ED/be-in.html [Accessed 4 April 2019].

Richards, Mary. 2017. "Marina Abramovic - Brunel University Research Archive". *Studylib.Net*. https://studylib.net/doc/9055576/marina-abramovic---bruneluniversity-research-archive. [accessed January 8, 2019]

Santayana, George. (2017). *Life Of Reason*: Five Volumes in One. Open Road Media. Available at: http://public.eblib.com/choice/publicfullrecord.aspx?p=4828848. [Accessed 13/4/2019].

Sedo, Anna Xambo, Sara Price, and Carey Jewitt. 2016. "Conceptualising And Researching The Body In Digital Contexts: Towards New Methodological Conversations Across The Arts And Social Sciences - Carey Jewitt, Sara Price, Anna Xambo Sedo, 2017". *SAGE Journals*. https://journals.sagepub.com/doi/full/10.1177/1468794116656036.Seegers, C. (n.d.). DADA Companion -- Cabaret Voltaire. [online] Dada-companion.com. Available at: http://www.dada-companion.com/cabaret/ [Accessed 4 April 2019].

**IVAPA** Project

Shelley, Esaak. 2019. *How To Understand Performance Art. Thoughtco*. Available at: https://www.thoughtco.com/performance-art-history-basics-182390. [Accessed 29 January 2019]

Stedelijk.nl. (2019). Kate Cooper. [online] Available at: https://www.stedelijk.nl/en/digdeeper/kate-cooper [Accessed 5/4/2019].

Tate. (n.d.). *Performance Art: The Happening – Essay / Tate*. [online] Available at: https://www.tate.org.uk/art/art-terms/h/happening/happening [Accessed 4 April 2019].

Venezia, La. 2019. "Biennale Cinema 2018 | Venice Virtual Reality". *La Biennale Di Venezia*. https://www.labiennale.org/en/cinema/2018/lineup/venice-virtual-reality. [Accessed 17 April 2019].

Waters, F. 2011. *The best online culture archives*. [online] Telegraph.co.uk. Available at: https://www.telegraph.co.uk/culture/8296365/The-best-online-culture-archives.html [Accessed 14 February 2019].

Wolkoff, J. (2018). *When Making a Salad Became Groundbreaking Performance Art*. Artsy.net. https://www.artsy.net/article/artsy-editorial-making-salad-groundbreaking-performance-art [Accessed 5 April 2019].

### Filmography

"Mirror Check @ Joan Jonas. 1970.". 2019. Artperformance.Org. http://www.artperformance.org/article-30265806.html.

"Carolee Schneeman". *YouTube*. Video File. https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=ep8bOYaLnN8 [retrieved 4/3/2019]

"Dziga Vertov, Man with the Movie Camera". Archive. Video File. [retrieved 4/3/2019]https://archive.org/details/ChelovekskinoapparatomManWithAMovieCamera

"Rebecca Horn". *Youtube*. Video File. [retrieved 5/3/2019] https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=O0uNnmAudmk

Rainer, Yvonne. "Hands Move". 1966. http://www.ubu.com/film/rainer\_hand-movie.html

The Art Assignment. 2016. *The Case For Performance Art | The Art Assignment | PBS Digital Studios*. Image. https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=EmMTKdUAokM.

UBUweb. "Yvonne Rainer". Film. MP3. [retrieved 11/3/2019] http://www.ubu.com/film/rainer\_hand-movie.html

Vernissage TV, "Mirror Check – Joan Jonas. Interview with Joan Jonas at 14 rooms", [accessed January 10, 2019] www.vernissage.tv/2014/07/02/joan-jonas-mirror-checkinterview-with-joan-Jonas-at-14-rooms/

Zhilvaeva, Anna. 2018. *Live Performance At The Louvre Museum Paris (Virtual Reality Art)*. Video. https://www.youtube.com/watch?time\_continue=46&v=Zs3n07Clw7A.

### Audios

*Marina Abramović And ULAY. Imponderabilia. 1977/2010.* 2019. Online. New York. https://www.moma.org/multimedia/audio/190/1974. [Accessed January 11, 2019.]

#### Seminars/ Lectures/ Speeches

Loulos, K. "Historical Memory and Culture". Seminar. National Kapodistrian University. 2015. (electronic notes from the lecture: Andronikos, M. 1986. Plato and Art).

Tate, Britain. 2019. "Memory, Archive And Conservation". Lecture, Khan Academy online. , , 2019. [realized March 2-7, 2019]

"Symposium Live Culture". 2003. Tate Modern, London Museum. https://www.adrianheathfield.net/project/live-culture, , 2003.

# Tableau of illustrations

Image 0.1	
Image 1.1 Yvonne Rainer Hand Movie. 1966	13
Image 1.2 Dick Higgins, "Intermedia Chart" - Original sketch for the italian version, Laser printed	, 28
x 21 cm, 1995	15
Image 1.3 "Intermedia Chart" - Variation by P. Corner, Manual intervention on digital printed	
cardboard, 100 x 70, 2009	
Image 1.4. Ancient Greek vase	
Image 1.5 Diagram of Oskar Schlemmer. Bauhaus 1-3 1927, 4	
Image 1.6 Performing act at Cabaret Voltaire	
Image 1.7 Bauhaus dancers in Dance of Space, 1926, Oskar Schlemmer	17
Image 1.8 Erik Satie's Ruse of Medusa (Le piège de Mĕduse) with Buckminster Fuller, William	
Shrauger, Elaine de Kooning and Merce Cunningham	
Image 1.9 Jackson Pollock	
Image 1.10 Murakami Saburo, "Passing Through" (1956). Performance view at the 2nd Gutai Art	
Exhibition, Ohara Kaikan, Tokyo, 1956.	
Image 1.11 Yves Klein, Anthropométries, 1960	
Image 1.12 Allan Kaprow, 18 Happenings in 6 Parts, 1959	
Image 1.13 Benjamin Patterson, Variations for Double-Bass, 1962	
Image 1.14 Nam June Paik, «Zen for Head», 1962	
Image 1.15 Alison Knowles, Make a Salad. 1962, Performed at the Institute of Contemporary Arts	
London, October 1962.	
Image 1.16 Joseph Beuys 7,000 Oaks" (1982). Presented the idea of social sculpture at Documenta (1982)	
Image 1.17 Valie Export, Tap and Touch Cinema	22
Image 1.18 Yoko Ono, Cut Piece. 1964	
https://fr.phaidon.com/agenda/art/articles/2012/may/02/spirit-of-the-age/	22
Image 1.19 RAND Technologies, GRaIL. 1968-9	24
Image 1.20 David Hockney, installation view, Hockney - Van Gogh: The Joy of Nature	24
Image 1.21 Anna Zhilvaeva, painting in VR the painting of Eugene Delacroix "Liberty Leading th	e
People". 2018, Louvre Museum	24
Image 1.22 Kate Cooper, Infection Drivers. 2018, Stedelijk Museum. video still	24
Image 1.23 Ed Atkins Even Pricks 2013	27
Image 1.24 The artist Stelarc reveals the current state of his ongoing "Ear on Arm" project	27
Image 1.25 Anish Kapoor, Into Yourself, Fall. 2018	27
Image 1.26 Pierre Huyghe, After ALife Ahead. 2017	27
Image 1.27 Jeff Koons, Pryne. 2018	28
Image 1.28 Marina Abramovic, Rising. 2018. video still, virtual reality	28
Image 1.29 Marina Abramovic, The Life. 2019, VR performance	29
Image 1.30 The Circle of Performance Art	30
Image 1.31 Ruins of Library of Alexandria	32
Image 1.32 The analysis of the term Archive	34
Image 1.33 Usage of term "archive" from 1800 until today	37
Image 1.34 Mark Dion, Tate Thames Dig. 1999 Credit: Heathcliff O'Malley	37
Image 1.35 Sigmund Freud's House	39
Image 1.36 Interactive Art and connections	41

Image 1.37 www.moma.org	42
Image 2.1 mind map about archive	45
Image 2.2 Do Ho Suh, Home Within Home. 2014. installation view	
https://www.ft.com/content/a187c15e-e287-11e6-9645-c9357a75844a	47
Image 2.3 3D Model of Notre Dame	
Image 3.1 Marina Abramovic and Ulay, Imponderabilia	52
Image 3.2 Eva et Franco Mattes, Marina Abramovic's imponderabilia, (2007)	52
Image 3.3 Dance or Exercise on the perimeter of a Square, Bruce Nauman. 1968 ©	53
Image 3.4 Hand sensors of Perception Neuron	54
Image 3.5 Wearing the MoCap Suit	
Image 3.6 Reenacting Bruce Nauman's Performance	
Image 3.7 Floor Plan of MAMBo (digital plan of the building in 70's and 80's	57
Image 3.8 façade of Museum of Bologna nowadays	
Image 3.9 architectural details from Google Earth	
Image 3.10 3D Museum of MAMBo in process	
Image 3.11 Experimenting on the face	
Image 3.12 Designing the face of Bruce Nauman in MakeHuman	
Image 3.13 3D Model of Joan Jonas	
Image 3.14 Avatar of Bruce Nauman	
Image 3.15 Avatar of Joan Jonas in Motion builder	
Image 3.16 Avatar of Joan Jonas in Motion builder	
Image 3.17 Avatar of Joan Jonas in Motion builder	
Image 3.18 Mirror Check in VR	
Image 3.19 Imponderabilia in VR	
Image 3.20 Imponderabilia in VR	
Image 3.21 Dance or Exercise to the perimeter of a Square in VR	
Image 3.22 Felix is trying the prototype	
Image 3.23 Basic plan for installation and visitor's movement	
Image 3.24 Sketch of Panopticon	68
Image 3.25 Armour-Stiner House. Source: Sarah, Dazzling 1860's Octagon House in New York	60
State. 2012, Digital Image.	
Image 3.26 Observatory Plan: Armour-Stiner House. Source: Joseph Pell Lombardi Architects (2) Digital Image.	
Image 3.27 TextMesh Coloring text, printscreen	
Image 3.27 Textwesh Coloring text, printscreen	
Image 3.29 3d model of Mona Hatoum	
Image 3.30 Nail by Mindfort	
Image 3.31 outside of the new gallery, Google Earth	
Image 3.32 the first design	
Image 3.33 Poster of exhibition	
Image 3.34 Working the 3d gallery in 3ds max	
Image 3.35 and Image 3.36 from video-documentations of reenactment in the laboratory of ATI	
Image 3.37 First try to create the boot in RealityCapture	
Image 3.38 Second try in RealityCapture	
Image 3.39 IVAPA Project first installing experimentat Lanal Vierual festival 2019 © Athina	
Kanellopoulou	78
Image 3.40 IVAPA Project – 2 <sup>nd</sup> room	

Image 3.41 IVAPA Project, Statement	80
Image 3.42 Artist, researcher, and curator Judith Guez in Imponderabilia 2019 $m{\mathbb{C}}$ Athina	
Kanellopoulou	81
Image 3.43 Marie-Helene Tramus and Michel Bret experiencing the archive 2019 © Athina	
Kanellopoulou	81
Image 3.44 Choreographer Margherita Bergamo is testing IVAPA	81
Image 3.45 Digital artist David is passing through the two virtual performers	81
Image 3.46 Dionysis Zamplaras is exploring Imponderabilia	82
Image 3.47 IVAPA Project	82
Image 3.48 Student from Universite Montpellier	82
Image 3.49 Etienne Pereny is walking through the two virtual bodies	82
Image 3.50 Visitors are waiting to experience one of the performances 2019	83
Image 3.51 Visitors are waiting to experience one of the performances 2019	83
Image 3.52 Text of Judith Guez	84
Image 3.53 Text of Margherita Bergamo	84
Image 3.54 Text of Gonzales Daniel	84
Image 3.55 Text of Zamplaras Dionysis	84
Image 3.56 Ivapa logo (White background)	85
Image 3.57 IVAPA logo (black background)	85
Image 3.58 Ivapa's webpage QR	86
Image 3.59 Website	86
Image 3.60 Athina Kanellopoulou, Con II. 2018	87
Image 3.61 Marina Abramovic, Rising. 2018	88
Image 3.62 Marina Abramovic, Rising. 2018	
Image 3.63 VR space of Roadworks	89
Image 3.64 Athina Kanellopoulou, Equilibria – Act I, II, III. 2019 © Athina Kanellopoulou	89

# **Index for Terms**

**Ars memorativa** (lat.) the art of memory, or Memo or Mnemonic (YATES, A. 2012) is the skill to remember and recall record using the memory through some specific technics, like "mnemotechnic" or "mind palace".

**Avantgardeness** (noun) is the state of being avant-garde. This entry is proposed and introduced into the art vocabulary for the first time in this paper by the author.

**Body Art** is a sub-category of performance art. Practically, means the action of an artist who is abusing his/her body in order to create an artwork through mutilation or reaching to its physical limits. ("Body Art". 2019)

Dasein is a term that Heidegger invented, describing the human sensation of "being here now".

**Digi-sein** is a term inspired by Dasein of Heidegger, describing the sensation of "being herenow in the digitality"

**Digital Body** is "a potential or even virtual sense of embodied self" (Broadhurst 2017. 1). The basis for questioning about the new kinds of bodies that are structured digitally could be sawn through the prism of a 'material-semiotic' approach in nature, society, and culture (Haraway 2003. 201)

**Digital Reality** is a description of the "wide spectrum of technologies and experiences that digitally simulate reality" ("What Is Digital Reality? | Digital Reality Consulting" 2019) in many ways. It can be representing a 3D or a 2D image/animation in VR, AR or MR.

**Digitality** is the consideration for the digital object. Digitality does not go against physicality, it simply enables new landscapes to be explored.

**The environment** in the framework of art is a term invented by artist Allan Kaprow (1927 – 2006) who was an American painter, assemblagist and a pioneer in establishing the concepts

of performance art. The usage of this art term can describe well the augmented and virtual environment as well.

Epitelesis is the Greek noun for describing the action of the performance.

**Immersion** is the sensation of being in a specific environment. There is the mental immersion, which refers in the state of being strongly engaged in the given environment, a kind of sensing the presence, and the physical immersion in which somebody is experiencing a medium though using his body (bodily).

**Loci** the parts. It is now used in the expression "method of loci", which is a method of improving the memory that uses the display to organize and recall information. Characterizes memory with local parameters. ("Oxford Dictionaries | The World's Most Trusted Dictionary Provider" 2019)

**Mind Palace** or Memory Palace is a mental immaterial structure aimed to help memory to recall information that is difficult to remember.

**Representational theory of mind (RTM)** is "the understanding that human agentive action is caused by internal mental states (eg beliefs, desires, intentions)" (Wellman 2017. 207-214).

**Site-specific art** is about the art that concerns a work designed for a particular space where it is going to stay. The term was invented by artist Robert Irwin, but he was used in the 1970s.

**Social sculpture** is a theory about the perception of life, developed in the 1970s by the artist Joseph Beuys, in which a utopian society and aesthetic practice are merged. This theoretical approach of utopia is based on the concept that everything is art, every aspect of life could be approached creatively and, as a result, everyone has the potential to be an artist. Thus, there was a strong belief that life is a social sculpture that everyone helps to shape. social sculptures, mainly, had political and environmental concerns, such as the artwork "7000 Oaks" (1982-87). This kind of artwork raised a lot of thoughts about urban planning, the sustainability of the

environment and the social structures. Nowadays, Beuys' concept of social sculpture is continued by other artists, like Pedro Reyes. ("Social Sculpture – Art Term | Tate" 2019)

**Topoanalysis** is a term invented and introduced by Gaston Bachelard in his book The Poetics of Space (1957), created by the two Greek words "topos", the place, and "analysis". Topoalalysis is "the systematic psychological study of the sites of out intimate lives" (Bachelard 1968. 8)

**Uncanny** Freud defines the unfamiliar as being at the same time bizarre, odorless, ominous (in the sense of the element that causes the feeling that something is wrong), horrible and scary. It is obviously the opposite of Heimlich [homemade], Heimlich [native], the opposite of the familiar. (Freud 1997. 341)